

Peer Review

Review of: "Untangling Magellanic Streams"

Elena Sabbi¹

1. International Gemini Observatory, NOIRLab, Tucson, United States

I read with great interest the manuscript “Untangling the Magellanic Streams” by Zaritsky, Conroy et al. The paper is well-written and presents a thorough and clear analysis of the possible stellar content of the Magellanic Stream, providing a very plausible explanation of the origin of the Stream’s strands; therefore, I recommend the paper for publication.

I have very minor comments/suggestions about the paper:

- 1) In the introduction “[43], hereafter [44], identified”: I think here [44] is the wrong citation.
- 2) In Fig. 3, there are a few H3 stars that fall outside the color-magnitude selection box. Similarly, in Fig. 4, there are a few stars that do not meet the tighter proper motion selections. Are these stars the same? Similarly, later in the paper, the authors consider the chemical properties of the H3 sample and identify two groups. Are any of the H3 stars with “anomalous” color part of the group of stars that do not meet the criteria applied to the Gaia stars? I suggest that the H3 stars that do not fall within the blue box in Fig. 3 are marked with different symbols, especially if they have some of the other “anomalous” characteristics.
- 3) The authors mention that Sgr stars fall outside the CMD selection criteria. Do they mean completely outside the plot, or just outside the blue box? In the second case, I would encourage the authors to plot the Sgr stars as well.
- 4) The choice of colors in Figs. 7 and 8 is confusing, as it almost suggests that the two groups of stars shown in Fig. 7 are the same as those shown in Fig. 8. I recommend that the authors continue to mark the H3 stars in red and blue also in Fig. 8 and use a different color (not just a symbol) to plot the stars identified by [45].
- 5) In Fig. 2, the MCs are marked with purple ellipses, not blue ones.

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.