

Review of: "From Earth to Art: Repurposing Clay Residues into Ephemeral Clay Sculptures of Organic Art and Styles"

Amit Shiuly¹

¹ Jadavpur University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Here's a point-wise review of the article, highlighting novelty, waste recycling, and sustainable development, along with suggestions for improvement:

1. Novelty of Work:

- **Strength:** The study explores a relatively under-researched area—repurposing clay residues into ephemeral clay sculptures, merging environmental sustainability with artistic innovation.
- **Suggestion:** Emphasize more clearly how this work stands apart from other sustainable art practices. Highlight the uniqueness of using clay residues specifically, in contrast to broader sustainable art practices that may focus on other materials.

2. Waste Recycling:

- **Strength:** The focus on reducing clay waste through creative reuse addresses a real environmental issue in the arts sector. The documentation of methods like material collection and processing is thorough.
- **Suggestion:** Provide more detailed quantitative data on the amount of clay residue repurposed, which could strengthen the environmental argument. Discuss how this method could be scalable for larger industries or institutions.

3. Sustainable Development:

- **Strength:** The research aligns well with global sustainable development goals (SDGs) related to waste management, resource efficiency, and responsible consumption. The incorporation of clay residues into art presents an eco-friendly model for sustainable artistic production.
- **Suggestion:** Explicitly link the study to specific SDGs (e.g., SDG 12: Responsible Consumption and Production). Include more discussion on the long-term environmental impacts of these practices and the potential for cultural shifts in material consumption.
- **You can add the following references for sustainable development**

10.1007/s41062-023-01116-7

10.1615/CompMechComputApplIntJ.2022044775

10.1007/s13762-023-04946-1

10.1016/j.matpr.2023.04.207

10.1615/CompMechComputApplIntJ.2022044775

4. Conceptual Framework (Material Engagement Theory - MET):

- **Strength:** The application of MET is a unique and compelling theoretical framework to understand the interaction between artists and reclaimed materials.
- **Suggestion:** Elaborate further on how MET connects with other contemporary sustainability theories. It could be strengthened by a brief comparative analysis with other theoretical frameworks used in sustainable art.

5. Artistic Methodology:

- **Strength:** The methodology involving artistic experimentation and workshops is well-designed, offering creative insight into the practical application of reclaimed clay.
- **Suggestion:** Provide clearer descriptions of the specific artistic outcomes, such as the forms of sculptures created, and how they align with contemporary art trends. Visual documentation of the sculptures and environmental impact assessments would enhance the study's practical significance.

6. Ephemeral Nature of Artworks:

- **Strength:** The transient quality of these sculptures ties in well with themes of nature, impermanence, and environmental cycles, promoting a fresh aesthetic.
- **Suggestion:** Consider including more analysis of the audience's reaction to this impermanence. Does it challenge their perception of art's value? This can lead to deeper reflections on the cultural impact of ephemeral art.

7. Environmental Impact & Life Cycle Analysis (LCA):

- **Strength:** The inclusion of an environmental impact assessment, such as LCA, is commendable and relevant to the study's objectives.
- **Suggestion:** Include more detailed LCA metrics or data to provide concrete evidence of the environmental benefits. Compare the environmental footprint of using clay residues with other commonly used artistic materials.

8. Cultural and Social Implications:

- **Strength:** The study touches on cultural perceptions of waste and the role of art in promoting environmental awareness.
- **Suggestion:** Expand on how this art form can drive cultural change in waste management, particularly in communities traditionally reliant on clay. What societal shifts could this practice inspire?

9. Documentation and Visual Analysis:

- **Strength:** The focus on visual and thematic analysis adds depth to the research, as it allows for the aesthetic and

conceptual review of the artworks.

- **Suggestion:** Consider adding more illustrative case studies or examples of similar sustainable art movements globally, and their influence on the field of art and environment.

10. Future Scope and Scalability:

- **Strength:** The study lays the groundwork for future sustainable practices in the arts sector.
- **Suggestion:** Discuss more about the potential scalability of this method and how it can be implemented in other regions or artistic disciplines. Providing a roadmap for extending these practices into other waste materials would be valuable.

By integrating these suggestions, the paper could further enhance its clarity, contribution to the field, and practical significance in terms of sustainability and waste recycling.