Review of: "Italy and SARS-CoV-2: How Did the Newly Graduates in Health Professions React? Organizational Aspects and Psychological Implications"

Saara Nasruddin[1]

1 University of Mississippi

Thank you for the opportunity to review this manuscript. I appreciate that this paper captures the experiences of new graduates in health care professional disciplines as these experiences are reflective of the needs for their training and preparation. I believe this manuscript is valuable to the readership; however, there are some modifications I've outlined below.

Introduction

Major Comments

Alter the tense of the pandemic and how health care professional training programs adapted to the past tense.

Define health professions schools—what disciplines do these include?

See the results section for my comments on the research objective.

Methods

Major Comments

Describe the literature (mental health or COVID-19 literature) used to develop the survey questions.

Describe the inclusion and exclusion criteria.

The objective is to measure the severity of anxiety and depressive symptoms, but why not employ an anxiety/depressive symptom scale such as the GAD-7 or PHQ-9? Moreover, describe why these survey questions were most appropriate for answering your objective compared to using such scales.

Minor Comments

Describe the research as a cross-sectional survey.

Change the survey administration to the past tense (i.e., "it was sent between 24 Sept").

Was there a reason for excluding nurses and obstetricians?

Results

Major Comments

There are a lot of interesting survey questions and findings; however, it's difficult to follow and digest exactly how they answer your main research question (which is about the severity of anxiety and depressive symptoms on clinical placement). Based on the stated research objective, I would expect logistic (or linear) regressions of anxiety and depressive symptoms as independent variables and clinical placement as the dependent variable. I think questions 3.1 and 3.2 and 2.3 align with the outcome variables of your objective, and 4.4 and 4.5 align with the independent variables of your objective. However, I suggest further investigation as to which items align with your objective, deciding whether or not to sum these items in a scale (would also recommend doing an exploratory factor analysis), and running one or more regression analyses. The rest of the survey findings can be put into a supplemental file, or you can add a secondary objective of describing the experiences of new healthcare professional graduates by discipline.

Minor Comments

Should "o" be "or" in the following sentence "The time spent in lockdown o semi-lockdown "?

What were the results of the chi-square and Kruskal-Wallis tests described in the analysis section?

Discussion

I would like to see changes to the data analysis and results, which may change the discussion section, before providing comments on this section.

Overall, thank you once again for the opportunity to review this manuscript. I think the data here can be very valuable to support building out emergency preparedness curriculum for health care professional schools.