Review of: "Assessment of soil erosion in the Cesar watershed, an initial step toward the restoration of the Cesar River"

A. G. Toledo-Bruno[1]

1 Central Mindanao University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Congratulations, authors, on this achievement. You have presented significant findings not only in terms of soil erosion for authorities to address the concern, but you have also shared methods for data analysis and presentations that other researchers can refer to.

May I suggest that you improve the first paragraph of the Introduction for a logical flow of ideas? You may also present findings of studies on soil erosion rates from other areas with similar biophysical conditions as the Cesar watershed as a basis for comparison of the results of your study.

In the Results, you mentioned that precipitation and land uses have caused the reduction of soil erosion rates for the period 2000-2010, but no supporting data was provided, e.g., how much was the reduction of precipitation over this time period? Is there an increase in vegetation cover that led to the reduction of soil erosion? It is also worth discussing the apparent decrease in soil erosion in the 2001-2010 period as shown in Fig. 2 and the increase in moderate to high erosion rates in the 2010-2020 period.

Since the title of this paper highlights the restoration of the Cesar River, it would be helpful for appropriate authorities to be given more specific recommendations rather than just general ones. For instance, what specific BMPs, policies, soil conservation measures, and sustainable soil management practices would you recommend given the current biophysical conditions of the Cesar River and its watershed?

Again, congratulations on your work! This is worth reading and sharing.