Qeios

Peer Review

Review of: "The Moral Responsibility of Designers Regarding AI: Protocol for a Meta-Aggregative Systematic Review"

Felix Rebitschek[1]

1. Universität Potsdam, Germany

The planned review on existing research with designers could fill a very important gap.

However, I have multiple concerns:

1. Introduction. I am missing a straightforward development of the underpinnings of moral responsibility. What constitutes it according to different philosophical frameworks? What are the moral responsibilities that the authors are considering exactly? What is social responsibility here?

2. The research question is too unfocused. The primary objective is more of a general statement. The secondary objectives are very broad and seem redundant. What is the difference between a primary and a secondary research question here (at the moment, they have substantial overlap in focus)? Overall, they do not follow sharply from the introduction.

3. The operationalisation of the search is unclear (how "ethical issues" are searched); how will Google Scholar search (e.g., up to how many result pages); including theoretical, conceptual but excluding review work seems hardly possible; the synonyms of moral responsibility (search terms?) do not have a justification; the search terms for Scopus/WOS are not comprehensible - are these just examples for strings or why is there "ethics" but not "moral-related terms"?

4. I doubt the feasibility of doing the same searches across 15 databases! Typically, four is very challenging.

5. The synthesis is not conclusive because a category system is aimed to be involved when ordering extracted information, but the similarity-approach (purely inductive) needs more explanation.

Overall, if the authors aim at a comprehensive picture of AI designers' responsibility, this needs to be grounded more in a "moral value theory," include sharp research questions, and have a better embedding in AI&Ethics literature, which has already contributed ethical frameworks for developers.

Minors:

– Review Team, better putting it behind the manuscript

– Table caption?

– Unclear sentence; "exempt from moral responsibility due to their design"?

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.