

Review of: "Comparative Analysis of Sustainable Livestock Development as a Source of Livelihood to Farmers of Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir"

Saulo Henrique Weber¹

¹ Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Paraná

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

General Comments:

- The topic of the article is important and relevant.
- The title is not considered adequate.
- All tables need to be revised.
- Units need to be specified.
- The states need to be better described.
- Several pieces of information are provided without references or proper evaluation in the present research.
- The conclusions are valid but seem somewhat vague and generic. Some of them are not related to the data presented throughout the text.
- The abstract needs to be revised. The article's objective, which was to compare sustainable development, does not seem to be clearly presented in the abstract. Almost half of the abstract is composed of a description of the Indian states.
- GDP is not defined in the text.

Specific Comments:

- **Livestock Population Dynamics:**
 - Table 1: The meaning of the values is not clear. The table is incomplete. Without a clear understanding of what these values represent, it is difficult to know if the conclusions drawn are correct.
 - "Adoption of cross-bred/improved Animals in both the states": "Nevertheless, due to agro-ecological/socio-economic limitations, ignorance, and inadequate resource availability and management, the population increase of crossbred cattle appeared to be weak." Was this evaluated in the research? If not, this conclusion cannot be drawn.
 - Table 2: The title is "Table 2. Number of exotic/crossbred cattle in Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir- 2012 & 2019", but it also includes information about sheep and pigs.
 - A comparison was made between arid and semi-arid regions, but the specific regions with these characteristics were not described.
 - Table 4: Coefficient of variance of what? This table is unnecessary. It could have been presented in text form.

- "India's per capita milk and egg availability improved or trended upward because of the government of India as well as government of Jammu and Kashmir implementing various schemes and improved cooperative performance." Which schemes are these?
- Table 5: The terms used (e.g., "% change of milk") are not self-explanatory.
- "Growth of veterinary institutions in Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir": "Veterinary hospital polyclinics/000 animals"?
- Table 7: Unnecessary. It could be presented in text format.
- "Planning and Fiscal Support"
- Table 8: What do those values represent?
- "Prospects for Livestock Farming"
- "Major challenges facing livestock sector in Maharashtra and Jammu and Kashmir": All items in this section of the article are not sufficiently supported or referenced.
- "Worldwide, people are becoming more hesitant and reluctant to raise livestock due to economic progress and rising income levels." What is the source of this information?
- "The markets for livestock and livestock products are undeveloped, erratic, unpredictable, and opaque" What is the source of this information?
- "Farm animals produce less on average" compared to what?

Recommendations:

- Revise the title to better reflect the content of the article.
- Revise all tables to ensure clarity, completeness, and accuracy.
- Specify the units used throughout the text.
- Provide more detailed descriptions of the states studied.
- Provide references for all information presented.
- Ensure that the conclusions are supported by the data presented.
- Revise the abstract to clearly state the objective of the research and the main findings.
- Define GDP in the text.
- Provide more information about the methods used to collect and analyze the data.
- Address the limitations of the study.
- Improve the overall writing style and clarity of the article.

Conclusion:

The article has the potential to be a valuable contribution to the field, but it requires significant revision before it can be published in a peer-reviewed journal. The authors are encouraged to address the comments and recommendations provided above in order to improve the quality of their manuscript.

