

Review of: "Appraisal of the UN Sustainable Development Goals: A Look Back and a Way Forward"

Sinta Ningrum¹

¹ Universitas Padjadjaran

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Strengths:

1. **Comprehensive Overview:** The article thoroughly assesses the progress made on the SDGs, covering both success and challenges. Including specific data points, such as the reduction in global poverty rates and improvements in education, strengthens the argument and provides a solid foundation for the analysis.
2. **Clear Structure:** The paper is well-organized, guiding the reader through the various aspects of the SDGs, from past achievements to future challenges. This structure makes the article accessible and easy to follow.
3. **Use of Scenarios:** Discussing potential future scenarios for the SDGs beyond 2030 adds depth to the analysis, encouraging readers to think about the long-term implications of current trends.

Areas for improvement:

1. **Clarity in Recommendations:** While the article discusses potential solutions for achieving the SDGs, these suggestions could benefit from more specificity. For example, the recommendation to "implement progressive taxation systems" could include examples of countries that have successfully implemented such systems and the specific steps involved, such as Sweden, Germany, and Canada.

Examples of Successful Progressive Taxation Systems:

1. **Sweden:** Sweden's progressive tax system is often cited as a success story. The country applies a high personal income tax rate to higher earners, coupled with lower rates on lower income brackets. This system funds extensive welfare programs and has significantly reduced income inequality. The key steps in implementing this system included:
 - **Policy Design:** Establishing clear tax brackets with increasing rates.
 - **Legislation:** Passing laws to ensure the tax structure is legally binding.
 - **Public Support:** Engaging the public and gaining broad support for the redistribution goals of the tax system.
 - **Compliance and Enforcement:** Implementing strong tax enforcement mechanisms to ensure compliance.
2. **Germany:** Germany has implemented a similar progressive tax system, with higher tax rates for higher-income earners. This system is designed to fund social security programs, including healthcare and pensions. Key steps included:

- **Assessment of Income Distribution:** Analyzing the income levels across the population to determine appropriate tax brackets.
 - **Gradual Implementation:** Introducing tax reforms gradually to allow for public and economic adaptation.
 - **Monitoring and Adjustment:** Continuously monitoring the system's impact on income inequality and making adjustments as needed.
1. **Methodological Rigor:** The article would be strengthened by a more precise explanation of the methods used to assess SDG progress. For instance, it is unclear how the article determines the “significant progress” in certain areas—clarifying this would enhance the credibility of the findings.

Methods Used to Assess SDG Progress:

To assess progress towards the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), several methods are typically employed:

1. **Data Collection and Indicators:** The most common method involves collecting data on specific indicators related to each SDG. For instance, poverty levels, literacy rates, and carbon emissions are tracked to measure progress on poverty, education, and climate action goals, respectively. National statistical agencies and international organizations like the UN usually gather this data.
2. **Trend Analysis:** This involves analyzing the changes in these indicators over time. Analysts can determine whether progress is being made by comparing current data with baseline figures from when the SDGs were launched.
3. **Peer Reviews and Country Reports:** Countries often submit voluntary national reviews (VNRs) that detail their progress towards the SDGs. These reports are shared in international forums, where they undergo peer review, providing an opportunity for feedback and shared learning.

These methods support findings by providing a systematic and transparent approach to evaluating progress, allowing for adjustments in strategies where necessary.

Clarifying the Article's Methodological Approach:

The article's methodological approach could be clarified by specifying the types of data and indicators used to assess SDG progress. This would involve:

1. **Indicator Selection:** Detailing which specific indicators were chosen to measure progress for each SDG, such as poverty rates, education enrollment numbers, or carbon emission levels.
2. **Data Sources:** Identifying the primary data sources, whether from national statistical agencies, international organizations like the UN, or independent research institutions.
3. **Analytical Techniques:** Explaining the methods used to analyze the data, such as trend analysis, statistical modeling, or comparative analysis between different countries or periods.
4. **Baseline and Comparison:** Clarifying the baseline data used for comparison helps understand the extent of progress or regression.

This level of detail would enhance the credibility of the findings and provide readers with a clearer understanding of how conclusions were drawn.

The article's methodological approach could be clarified by specifying the data types and indicators used to assess SDG progress. This would involve:

1. **Indicator Selection:** This section details which specific indicators, such as poverty rates, education enrollment numbers, or carbon emission levels, were chosen to measure progress for each SDG.
2. **Data Sources:** Identifying the primary data sources, whether from national statistical agencies, international organizations like the UN, or independent research institutions.
3. **Baseline and Comparison:** Clarifying the baseline data used for comparison helps understand the extent of progress or regression.

This level of detail would enhance the credibility of the findings and provide readers with a clearer understanding of how conclusions were drawn.

1. **More Detailed Case Studies:** The paper mentions partnerships and initiatives like Gavi and the SUN Movement, but these examples could be expanded into more detailed case studies. This would provide a richer context for understanding how specific strategies have contributed to progress and could offer practical insights for replicating success in other areas.

Specific Examples or Data Points for Detailed Case Studies:

1. **Gavi, the Vaccine Alliance:** A more detailed case study could explore how Gavi's partnerships have significantly increased vaccination rates in developing countries. For example, since its inception in 2000, Gavi has immunized over 888 million children, preventing more than 15 million future deaths. This could highlight the effectiveness of multi-stakeholder collaboration in achieving SDG targets related to health.

Impact: Gavi has been instrumental in increasing global immunization rates, particularly in low-income countries. Since its inception in 2000, Gavi has helped to immunize over 888 million children, preventing more than 15 million future deaths. This initiative has significantly reduced mortality rates for preventable diseases like measles, polio, and pneumonia.

Strategies Used:

1. **Public-Private Partnerships:** Gavi pools resources and expertise from governments, pharmaceutical companies, civil society organizations, and international agencies like WHO. This collaboration ensures a steady supply of affordable vaccines to countries in need.
2. **Tailored Country Support:** Gavi works closely with countries to identify their specific immunization challenges and develop tailored strategies. These include strengthening health systems, improving vaccine delivery, and ensuring equitable access.
3. **Focus on Equity:** Gavi's strategies emphasize reaching marginalized and underserved populations, ensuring that all

children, regardless of location or socio-economic status, have access to life-saving vaccines.

4. **The SUN Movement:** A case study on the Scaling Up Nutrition (SUN) Movement could detail how its country-led approach has reduced stunting in children under five. Specific data could include reducing stunting rates from 40% in 1990 to 22% in 2020 in participating countries, demonstrating the impact of integrated nutrition programs.

Impact: The SUN Movement has successfully mobilized over 60 countries to tackle malnutrition through a coordinated, multi-sectoral approach. Since its launch in 2010, SUN has been credited with significant reductions in stunting rates among children under five, particularly in countries like Nepal, where stunting decreased from 57% in 2001 to 36% in 2016.

Strategies Used:

1. **Country-Led Initiatives:** SUN supports national governments in developing and implementing nutrition strategies tailored to local contexts. This empowers countries to take ownership of their nutrition goals.
2. **Multi-Sectoral Approach:** SUN integrates efforts across various sectors, including agriculture, health, education, and social protection, to address the underlying causes of malnutrition. This holistic approach ensures comprehensive solutions.
3. **Global Partnerships:** Similar to Gavi, SUN leverages partnerships with international organizations, donors, NGOs, and the private sector to enhance resources, expertise, and advocacy for nutrition initiatives.

These case studies illustrate how Gavi and the SUN Movement have effectively utilized strategic partnerships, country-specific approaches, and a focus on equity to achieve significant public health and nutrition impacts.

1. **Engagement with Critical Perspectives:** While the article provides a balanced view of the SDGs' progress, it could benefit from engaging more critically with the SDG framework's inherent challenges and limitations. For instance, discussing criticisms about the feasibility of achieving all 17 goals simultaneously or the possible trade-offs between them could provide a more nuanced analysis.
2. **Data and Visualization:** Incorporating more visual aids like graphs or charts would make the statistical data more accessible and impactful. This would help visually emphasize critical points and trends in the text.

Analytical Techniques: Explaining the methods used to analyze the data, such as trend analysis, statistical modeling, or comparative analysis between different countries or periods.

Conclusion:

The article is a well-rounded analysis of the progress and challenges related to the UN Sustainable Development Goals. By enhancing the specificity of its recommendations, clarifying its methodological approach, and incorporating more detailed case studies and critical perspectives, the paper could provide even more valuable insights for policymakers and stakeholders involved in sustainable development.

