

Review of: "A Research Note on Natural Reclamation Processes that Support Mangrove Biodiversity Spheres: Sedimentation in Three Major River Deltas in Northwestern Luzon Using Aerial Imagery"

Marie-Christine Cormier-Salem¹

¹ Institute of Research for Development

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This article is interesting because from original analyses of maps and satellite images (topographic maps, remote sensing and geographic information systems) at various periods on 3 deltas of Luzon (Philippines), the author confirms the robustness of mangroves, their ability to recover spontaneously when environmental conditions are met. This is an important contribution to the debate on (ecological) mangrove restoration, or Nature-based Solutions, at a time when large-scale mangrove reforestation campaigns are still being implemented without taking into account the complexity and diversity of mangrove socio-ecosystems.

The additional interest of this article is the analysis on the long time of the dynamics of mangroves, with comparisons between various periods (1979 - 2013).

The multiscalar and mutitime-span approach is relevant

The detail on the access to the terrain is also interesting.

The figures are very pedagogic (notably with QR code to have access to the video)

The focus on sediments and hydrology is fine. There are appropriate data on the sedimentation process (new landform) and mangrove density.

But the author could more discussed the other conditions for the mangrove recolonisation/ reclamation

What is missing or the biases or limitations of this article are namely :

- data on species diversity
- analysis of socio-political conditions, past uses, current perceptions or representations of mangroves
- Discussion on other indicators of a "beautiful" or healthy mangrove (beyond kaolinite, iron oxides and tidal flushing)

To summ-up, this is an original scientific contribution on the mangroves of Luzon with a very pedagogical illustrative apparatus and interesting pragmatic aspects on field surveys (piloted and remotely piloted aircraft), but it needs :

- an introduction that clarifies the objective of this article,

- an argument that goes beyond the case studied: in what way is this dynamic specific or not to Luzon? Are there not other contexts favorable to such dynamics? I am thinking in particular of the Amazon, Niger, Ganges-Bramaputra deltas
- a discussion on the notion of "healthy mangrove" and other factors of the dynamics
- a conclusion that resituates the stakes and opens perspectives