

Review of: "Lymphoma: Potential Viral Antagonism between HTLV-1 and JCV Associated with Increased Survival Time"

Lucian Giubelan

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

<!-- /* Style Definitions */ p.MsoNormal, li.MsoNormal, div.MsoNormal {mso-style-parent:""; margin:0in; margin-bottom:.0001pt; mso-pagination:widow-orphan; font-size:12.0pt; font-family:"Times New Roman"; mso-fareast-font-family:"Times New Roman";} @page Section1 {size:8.5in 11.0in; margin:1.0in 1.25in 1.0in 1.25in; mso-header-margin:.5in; mso-footer-margin:.5in; mso-paper-source:0;} div.Section1 {page:Section1;} -->

About the manuscript "Lymphoma: potential viral antagonism between HTLV-1 and JCV associated with increased survival" written by Ante Tomasovic

First thing, I am not sure what type of article this is. It is true that the abstract starts by claiming this is a "short note point," but I want to suggest adding some explicit text stating that this is a medical hypothesis or medical opinion which requires further research on the matter.

For the introduction, I am not exactly sure why two paragraphs deal with similarities between HTLV-1 and HIV, since the main discussion is between similarities with JCV. Adding some text about JCV is a must.

I would like to suggest merging the main content with the discussion. As regarding the statement "Comparative analysis of JCV and HTLV1 protein with BLAST... Best alignment..." citation is needed. There is just one reference for the hypothesis that a higher survival rate is associated with detection of polyomavirus DNA in serum and just one reference for the prevalence of JCV antibodies in patients with lymphoma as compared with a healthy control group. More work is needed. For instance, is the difference in antibody seroprevalence (59% vs 49%) statistically significant?

Discussion: There are two paragraphs on the possible competing JCV proteins for the HTLV1 protease and possible cross reactivity between the two viruses. I would like to suggest adding some text that explicitly states this is a hypothesis.

I would like to suggest to the author adding some text with possible research pathways to confirm or not his hypothesis (e.g., synthesizing a vaccine against JCV, immunizing patients with lymphoma, and searching for survival rates as compared with a control non-immunized group).

I would like to suggest expansion of the reference list (if possible).

In conclusion, my opinion is that much work is to be done before publishing.

Lucian Giubelan

Infectious Diseases Department, University of Medicine and Pharmacy, Craiova, Romania