Review of: "Towards a model-based approach: applications to historical demography and palaeodemography"

Avner Bar-Hen[1]

1 Conservatoire National des Arts et Métiers

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This article is a transcription of a talk (but where?). The objective is far from clear and could be included in the abstract or, at the very least, in the introduction. However, proposing a typology of models is an interesting idea.

I won't comment on the English, except to say that it sounds too informal compared to my French bias.

Page 3: Lotka was born in 1880 and couldn't have proposed a model in 1639 (and, therefore, cannot be compared to Newton).

Page 3: In a similar vein, Jean Bourgeois-Pichat passed away in 1990 and couldn't have proposed anything in 1994.

Page 4: The sentence, "This approach is very interesting as it eliminates the need for empirical data," should be discussed.

Recursive Bayesian Networks (Pena et al., 2002) is an interesting and innovative network, but its primary aim is to generalize existing networks like DBN. Your claims about their properties should be more thoroughly supported.