

Review of: "Alcohol Consumption in Ancient India and the Contemporary Challenges: A Study of Socio-Economic Implications and Anti-Liquor Protests in Tamil Nadu"

Eleanor Ross¹

¹ University of Johannesburg

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Thank you for the opportunity to review this eloquently written article focusing on the complex nature of alcohol consumption in Tamil Nadu. I particularly enjoyed the discussion of the impact of historical, cultural and contemporary political factors on alcohol consumption. However, in order to enhance the quality of the manuscript, the following issues need to be addressed:

1. Under the section, 'Alcohol consumption in ancient India: a socio-cultural exploration', the author states: "This drinking culture displays significant variance based on cultural, caste, and ethnic differences". It would be helpful to provide some examples of these differences.
2. Please expand briefly on "the ethical frameworks that govern individual and collective behaviors in Indian society".
3. There are too many objectives. I suggest combining the first three so that there are six in total rather than eight.
4. Ethical considerations - Did the author obtain ethical clearance from an accredited ethical review board?
5. What is the date for the All India Institute of Medical Sciences report?
6. There are numerous examples of unsupported statements and assertions. For example, the "family drinking" phenomenon in Kerala needs to be supported with a reference. The paragraph "In the rapidly evolving modern Indian landscape...contemporary India" needs to be supported with evidence. Similarly, where is the evidence to support the claims of "hooch tragedies" in Kerala and Tamil Nadu? Where were these incidents reported? Please include the sources from which the information on deaths was obtained. The statement on the impact of excessive drinking on wives and children, and the increase in child labor needs to be based on empirical evidence. Please use a reference to support the assertion of a steady increase in households led by women.
7. Many of the references are old and outdated and need to be replaced with more recent sources, preferably from scientific empirical research rather than newspaper articles.
8. For the benefit of international readers, please explain the term "beedi rolling".
9. The author talks about "the 2021 elections for the Tamil Nadu Legislative Assembly draw near". However, we are currently at the end of 2023; hence this statement needs to be corrected.