

# Review of: "Crime Prevention through Environmental Design — Enhancing Safety and Livability in Maqboolpura, Amritsar: An Adaptive Approach to Crime Prevention in Informal Settlements"

Sepideh Besharati Kivi<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> University of Oklahoma

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

**Title:** *The title is considered long for several reasons.*

Crime Prevention through Environmental Design — Enhancing Safety and Livability in Maqboolpura, Amritsar: An Adaptive Approach to Crime Prevention in Informal Settlements

The original title of your article is considered too long for a few key reasons that impact its effectiveness in an academic context.

First, academic titles should be short and clear to quickly express the main idea and make a strong initial impact. The current title's length adds complexity and can distract from the main point.

Second, it repeats certain phrases, like "**Crime Prevention**," which is unnecessary and can make the title less brief. In academic writing, avoiding repetition is important for clarity.

A title should clearly emphasize the paper's main points without including too much detail that can make the focus unclear.

## **Abstract:**

The abstract of your article provides a comprehensive overview of the issue at hand, but there are a few areas for improvement.

- The phrase "Indian cities' informal settlements are also becoming unsafe, which has a negative psychological impact on residents" could be clearer. Consider rephrasing to "Informal settlements in Indian cities are becoming increasingly unsafe, negatively impacting residents' psychological well-being."
- In "Locals' sense of safety is negatively affected by these rates, along with their ability to enjoy the surroundings," the connection between the crime rates and their impact is slightly unclear. It could be rephrased for better clarity.
- There are a few long sentences that could be broken into shorter ones for better readability and comprehension.
- The abstract should introduce key concepts or strategies at the beginning and specify the nature of the adaptive livability interventions earlier.

- While the issues in Maqboolpura are well-highlighted, the abstract could briefly mention the methods or specific aspects of the study to give the reader a better understanding of how the study was conducted.
- The final sentence could be stronger. Instead of saying "may be used as a key tool," a more definitive statement like "are a key tool" would confidently assert the importance of your findings.

### **Suggestions for Improvement:**

- Consider adding a sentence at the beginning that more directly states the purpose of the study. For example, "This study investigates the relationship between crime prevention and livability in informal settlements, with a focus on Maqboolpura, Punjab."
- Use a more active voice where possible to strengthen the statements. For example, "This study demonstrates" could be "This study aims to demonstrate."
- Ensure that the abstract clearly defines the scope of the study, including any specific focus on crime prevention and livability.

### **Introduction:**

- Begin with a specific statement about Maqboolpura to immediately draw the reader's attention to the main subject. For example: "In the rapidly urbanizing landscape of India, Maqboolpura, an informal settlement in Punjab, exemplifies the pressing challenges of crime and livability faced by growing urban populations."
- Break down complex sentences for better clarity. For instance: "As per the 2011 Census of India, the urban population increased from 78.9 million in 1961 to 377 million. This growth accounts for almost one-third of India's total population, highlighting the expanding urbanization."
- " Integrate statistics in a smoother way, for example: "This urban expansion has led to a significant rise in informal settlements. In India, for example, 17.34% of urban households, approximately 13.70 million, reside in such settlements, often overlooked in urban planning."
- Introduce and define critical terms at their first mention. For example: "This study introduces the concept of 'adaptive livability interventions', strategies designed to enhance the quality of life by addressing both crime prevention and living conditions in informal settlements."

### **Section 2.2.1: Concept and Principles of Livability**

- The sentence "The standard of living in a place is determined by factors such as affordable housing, convenient transportation, and public services that are accessible" could be improved by adding commas for clarity: "...factors such as affordable housing, convenient transportation, and public services that are accessible."
- The phrase "Some researchers have defined livability in terms of specific indicators such as walkability, air quality, and access to green spaces" also needs commas: "...specific indicators such as walkability, air quality, and access to green spaces."
- **Suggestions:**

- Consider providing a brief introduction or background to the concept of livability to establish a context for readers who may not be familiar with it.
- The section might benefit from a more direct connection between the general concept of livability and its specific application in the context of informal settlements.

### **Section "In Indian Context"**

- The sentence structure in several places is complex, which affects readability. For example, "Similarly to this, India may place a higher value on social inclusion, cultural diversity, and community than some other countries do." Consider rephrasing for clarity and readability.
- Commas are missing in several places, affecting the flow of the text. For instance, "Similarly to this, it's possible that India places a higher value on social inclusion, cultural diversity, and community than some other countries do."
- **Suggestions:**
  - Clarify the differences in the concept of livability between India and developed countries at the start of the section for a smoother transition.
  - More detailed examples or case studies from India could enrich the discussion on how India's approach to livability differs from that in developed countries.

### **Section 3: Case Study: Maqboolpura Amritsar Punjab**

- The phrase "a stark contrast to the rest of the city" could be more specific about what aspects of Maqboolpura contrast with the rest of Amritsar.
- "The city has grown rapidly from a population of 1.62 lacs in 1901 to over 20 lacs in 2011" could use a clarification or conversion for an international audience unfamiliar with the term "lacs."
- **Suggestions:**
  - The introduction to the case study could be more engaging. Consider adding more descriptive details about Maqboolpura to draw the reader into the unique aspects of this settlement.
  - The section could benefit from a clearer explanation of how the case study's findings will contribute to the broader understanding of informal settlements in India.

### **Section 5: Discussion and Findings**

- The sentence "These issues are the result of local governance negligence and poverty and illiteracy among residents" could be restructured for clarity.
- "Non-compliance with planning and building regulations is one of the most critical issues leading to uneven plot and house sizes and textures" is confusing and could be simplified.
- **Suggestions:**
  - Expanding on how local governance negligence specifically contributes to the challenges in Maqboolpura would

provide more depth.

- Providing examples or more details on the nature of unplanned street styles and their impact would enhance the reader's understanding.

## Section 6: Conclusion

- The section contains long sentences that could be broken down for better readability. For example: "The most important people who are indulged in drug addiction can earn from these proposed small-scale industries."
- Some phrases are awkwardly phrased, such as "The essential part of creating an affordable built-up and open spaces approach."
- **Suggestions:**
  - The conclusion could be strengthened by summarizing key findings more succinctly and clearly.
  - It would be beneficial to explicitly connect the conclusion back to the broader theme of livability in informal settlements and the specific case of Maqboolpura.

## Statistical Methods Review

The data collection method for the primary survey is mentioned briefly (L1644-L1650), but there is insufficient detail on the sample size, sampling technique, and the type of data collected.

The article needs a clear explanation of the analytical techniques used to interpret the data. For example, how were the collected data translated into the livability index scores? The inclusion of statistical tests, regression models, or other analytical methods would add rigor to the study.

There is no mention of how the results were validated or cross-checked against other data sources or studies. Validation is crucial, especially when dealing with complex issues like urban planning and livability.

## Suggestions:

Expand the methodology section to include more details about how indicators were chosen, the methods used to collect data, the size of the sample, and the analysis techniques. This will make the paper more thorough and precise.

**Address Limitations and Future Research:** Mention the study's limitations and suggest ideas for future research. This might involve using different indicators, expanding the research to more cities, or conducting long-term studies to observe changes over time.