

Review of: "The Informational Universe of Allah: An Islamic Perspective on Quantum Information Theory"

Uwe Meixner¹

¹ Universität Augsburg

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

There are several points to be made about this article. It needs a lot of improvement regarding the quality and scope of the philosophico-theological discussion in it.

1. The article is verbose, repetitive, and sometimes, so to speak, adulatory (I don't know how often I have read the word "profound" in the article, but I am sure it was very often); the article sorely needs to be tightened.
2. Its central aim is to show the compatibility of Islamic theology and quantum theory. But the aim of the authors might as well have been to show the compatibility of monotheistic Abrahamic theology and quantum theory; for there is nothing particularly Islamic about the theology the authors adduce. The all-knowingness and all-awareness of God are mainstays also of standard Christian theology.
3. The problem of quantum theory for Islamic theology consists in this: quantum theory seems to entail indeterminism, whereas Allah, according to Islamic doctrine, is all-determining, which entails that the world is ruled by a strict determinism. The hardly surprising solution of the authors of the present article, who firmly stand by the theology they believe in, is this: The apparent indeterminism in the world is an illusion due to our essential human ignorance, our essentially limited knowledge. However, the prevailing interpretation of quantum theory is that quantum theory indeed implies (ontological) indeterminism (and not just a watered-down merely epistemic "indeterminism"). The authors should address the arguments that are adduced by adherents of the prevailing interpretation.
4. The discussion is really a very old one. Ever since the Middle Ages, theologians (Christian theologians and, I feel sure, also Islamic theologians) have discussed whether the all-knowingness of God/Allah entails determinism. Some Christians have happily embraced determinism, but most of them rejected determinism - without thereby necessarily rejecting the all-knowingness of God. The arguments pro and contra are complex. I recommend for further reading my article about a priori arguments for determinism - which is available here on Qeios.
5. Allah is merciful according to Islam (just as God is merciful according to Christianity). What could it mean for Allah to be merciful when at the same time He determines everything? Think about this. (It seems: In case Allah determines everything, there is really nobody - except perhaps Himself - whom He could forgive anything.)