

Review of: "Political Economy and Ecology of International Regional Development: Indonesia Urban and Rural Development Loans from the Asian Development Bank (ADB)"

Chikaodinaka Iwuagwu

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

I found the report to be both intriguing and insightful, as the authors dedicated ample effort to its development and candidly shared their observations on the Indonesian economy. However, I have identified several areas where improvements could enhance the paper's rigor and impact:

Theoretical Foundation: The absence of formulas or models to substantiate and validate the theories presented in the paper is notable. To bolster the paper's academic underpinning, I recommend incorporating relevant mathematical frameworks that can provide a robust basis for the theories advanced.

Balancing Sentiment and Fact The paper occasionally leaned more towards a sentimental tone rather than grounding its arguments in factual analysis. To address this, I suggest the authors provide empirical evidence to support their assertion that the loans from ADB have had limited impact on Indonesia. Graphical representations and figures showcasing loan disbursement periods juxtaposed with changes in reserves could serve to elucidate any potential correlations or causal links.

Debt Impact Analysis: Expanding on the financial implications of the loans, the authors could delve into the increased debt-to-GDP ratio and debt servicing incurred due to interest charges. This could be accomplished by conducting a thorough analysis of the interest rates applied to these loans, exploring whether they are excessive, and determining their negative repercussions on the economy.

Link to Poverty Alleviation: An interesting dimension to explore would be the relationship between ADB-disbursed loans and the poverty rate in Indonesia. I recommend that the authors create a graph that illustrates the relationship between these loans and the poverty rate over time. Additionally, this claim could be substantiated by referencing a graphical representation of the poverty levels since the inception of the ADB, thereby providing historical context.

In conclusion, the authors' dedication to the paper's development is evident, and their insights into the Indonesian economy are valuable. However, refining the theoretical foundations, incorporating empirical evidence, addressing the sentiment-fact balance, and expanding on key relationships could elevate the paper's academic robustness and practical relevance.

