

Review of: "Forget the cake: let them work. Conflicting narratives towards work, health and the plight of asylum seekers in the UK"

Israel E-C1

1 Universidad de Oviedo

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The central point of this article/paper/essay is the analysis of the conflicting narrative in the United Kingdom about asylum seekers and the labour market. On the one hand, there are a large number of job vacancies and on the other, there is an express ban on asylum seekers being able to work. This ban could have both macroeconomic and personal effects. As for the former, the high number of vacancies could put a brake on the UK economy, already put into tension after Brexit and after the Covid-19 pandemic. Secondly, the academic literature has verified that employment would indeed be causally related to better mental health if we compare it with unemployment. For this reason, the possibility of an asylum seeker having a job could help them improve their mental health and improve their adaptation to their new country of residence.

The article is well written, although I miss a greater weight of the data. This paper would greatly benefit from further descriptive analysis of the situation of people who have applied for asylum in the UK or even in another country. Perhaps the hypothetical lack of data can be filled with scientific literature on the matter. In this sense, the papers of Heeren et al. (2012) or Kronick (2018) could be cited. It can also be filled, as someone else has already commented, with a qualitative analysis carried out with people who have requested asylum in the country.

The greatest interest of the work lies in the idea that the United Kingdom Government transmit about the need to work as if it were the solution to every problem, that is, regardless of what type of work it is. This is, always from my point of view, the greatest interest of the work. It has really been studied, as I have already said, that the mental health of unemployed people deteriorates compared to people with a job, but it is also widely studied how people with precarious jobs have worse mental health than people in non-jobs. precarious. The interest of this point would require further development by the author.

References

Heeren, M., Mueller, J., Ehlert, U. et al. Mental health of asylum seekers: a cross-sectional study of psychiatric disorders. BMC Psychiatry 12, 114 (2012). https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-244X-12-114

Kronick R. Mental Health of Refugees and Asylum Seekers: Assessment and Intervention. Can J Psychiatry. 2018 May;63(5):290-296. doi: 10.1177/0706743717746665. Epub 2017 Dec 5. PMID: 29207884; PMCID: PMC5912300.

