

Review of: "FDA Decision to Authorize NJOY ACE Menthol Was Based on a Rigorous Review of the Science to Determine That the Benefits Outweigh the Risk"

Asaad Babker¹

¹ Gulf Medical University, United Arab Emirates

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Overall, the response provides a strong defense of the FDA's decision, supported by scientific evidence and public health principles. Strengthening engagement with critiques, enhancing the context around data, and providing pathways for dialogue could further reinforce the arguments made. The response highlights the scientific process behind the FDA's decision, emphasizing that it was not arbitrary but based on extensive research and data. Citing studies and data trends helps to enhance the credibility of the arguments made.

Suggestions for how the article could be improved:

- A more pointed engagement with her arguments would make the defense more robust.
- More detailed explanations about what constitutes harmful and potentially harmful constituents (HPHCs) and how they were measured in NJOY products could provide clearer insights for readers unfamiliar with tobacco science.