

Review of: "Choosing to Stay: Unpacking Immobility Amidst Adversity in Migration Studies"

Martha Apple¹

¹ Montana Tech

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This is an interesting and valuable manuscript that I recommend for publication. It is approachable and well-written, and it is especially timely with respect to conflict zones, resource disparities, and the effects of climate change on access to clean water, safety from storms, and the ability to grow crops successfully.

This is a minor point, but I suggest defining the acronym IDP (Internally Displaced Person) the first time it appears in the text. Although many people know what IDP stands for in this context (and certainly many of the likely readers do), I think it will make the paper more informative for readers from other groups. Also, as time passes, acronyms and terminology can change, so that readers of the future will not have to rely solely on the acronym.

The figures are excellent and clear.

#1-OIU - Y appears twice, but I think this is intentional. Still, there could be a sentence briefly stating why it appears the second time.

What are host communities, and how are they set up? What factors are involved in initiating a host community? Are the host communities somehow unaffected by conflict? How are the residents of host communities defined in terms of immobility categories? Since host communities are communities, it implies that their residents have not moved. It seems likely that host communities span a range of situations and circumstances, as well as differences in proximity to conflict and resource availability. It would be interesting to hear more about the host communities.

What factors influence the proportion of people living in camps vs. in host communities or other places? Do more people live in camps when conflicts/disasters are greater?

One minor thing is that in the Mata-Codesid, D. reference, the word "Mexican" doesn't need a bullet point.

Thank you for the opportunity to review this interesting and thoughtful paper.

