

Review of: "A Research Note on Natural Reclamation Processes that Support Mangrove Biodiversity Spheres: Sedimentation in Three Major River Deltas in Northwestern Luzon Using Aerial Imagery"

Kiyoshi Fujimoto¹

¹ Nanzan University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This research note, which attempts to extract shoreline changes using topographic maps created from aerial photographs from the 1960s and 1970s and high-resolution satellite imagery from 2013, has some material value, but several problems can be identified, as described below. Appropriate corrections to these problems are necessary to publish this manuscript as a scientific document.

1. Aerial photography by drone has been done, but it is unclear how the data was used in this research note. It is meaningless to just show an aerial video. Please add to the methods and results how you specifically utilized this aerial photography data in preparing this research note.
2. Figure 5 shows that the islands in the lagoon on the south side of the river mouth have disappeared between the two time points. The coastal bar also seems to have been eroded and retreated. Please map not only the depositional area but also the erosion area. According to the IPCC's Fifth Assessment Report (IPCC 2013), sea level rise between 1993 and 2012 around the Philippines exceeded 10 mm per year, well above the global average (https://www.ipcc.ch/site/assets/uploads/2018/02/WG1AR5_Chapter13_FINAL.pdf, p. 1148, FAQ13.1, Figure 1). The erosion events may be associated with this rapid sea-level rise. Figures 9 and 11 should also illustrate the erosion area as well.
3. The scale bar in Figure 6 should be modified to 1000m (1km) segments, not halfway numbers. This will make it easier to get a sense of the distance. Also, please add azimuth signs and scale bars to all other figures.
4. Is Figure 7 part of the range of Figure 5? If it is part of Figure 5, please indicate in Figure 5 where the extent of Figure 7 is.
5. Figure11 and Figure15 are the same image. It is obvious that one of them is incorrect. Please replace the incorrect one with the correct figure. Also, please clarify the extent of these figures in Figures 9 and 13, respectively.
6. The red areas in Figures 7, 11, and 15 contain not only mangrove forests but also terrestrial vegetation. Please indicate clearly which areas are mangrove forests by drawing a line around them or by shading them.