Review of: "Deep roots of admixture-related cognitive differences in the USA?"

Gregory Connor

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Excellent work; very careful and thorough. Figure 1 is helpful to provide graphical intuition even though it does not contain as much formal statistical information as in the tables.

Peter Frost's point about selection-related bias impacting the positive link between European admixture - cognitive ability is well-founded. However, it seems to me that this impact is likely second-order, and derivative of the underlying cause which is genetic variation. The higher literacy of “mulatto” households (to use the historical term) is best understood as partly reflecting genetic variation and partly reflecting genotype-phenotype interaction, whose underlying cause is the same genetic variation. To give an analogy, the households of academic physicists contain on average many more mathematics books than average households, but the presence of these books is not the main reason that the children raised in these households tend to perform above average on mathematics tests. Academic physicists are talented in mathematics and pass this talent genetically to their children. They also have more mathematics books in the home, but this is just genotype-phenotype interaction and is not the underlying causal factor for their children's above-average mathematics performance. Similarly genetic variation across ancestries is the main causal factor for the findings in this paper. Peter Frost's point is theoretically correct, but using empirical judgment I suspect it is a second order effect and derivative of the underlying cause.