

# Review of: "Weathering changes – livelihood adaptation to weather shocks in rural India by disadvantaged social groups"

Subrat Sarangi<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> XLRI - Xavier School of Management

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The topic is relevant and pertinent. I appreciate the choice of topic and hence its contribution to the domain. Some of the constructive feedback that I wish to provide to improve the manuscript quality are as follows:

1. The references need to be current. For example while building the theme the author(s) state "However, temporary or circular migration for work has increased over the years (Deshingkar 2008)." - this is a very critical statement but the reference is very old. There are several i.e., "Migration is generally low in India compared to countries at similar stages of development (Keshri and Bhagat, 2010; Munshi and Rosenzweig, 2016; Topalova 2010).", "The bulk of the movement is within the same district followed by those within the states, with around a tenth of the migration being interstate (Bell et al. 2015).", "As a result, they often decide on profitable opportunities (Kanbur, 1979; A.V. Banerjee and Newman 1991)". The authors need to revisit the entire manuscript and take more recent works and update the references.
2. The authors state - "Dallmann and Millock (2017) show that drought frequency in the origin state increases interstate migration in India. This effect is stronger in agricultural states." It would be important to understand how the authors define "agricultural states".
3. I wish to have more clarity on the Data section where authors state - "We use TS4.04 data for monthly gridded precipitation and potential evapotranspiration for 1970-2010 from the Climate Research Unit of the University of East Anglia (Harris et al. 2020) to construct SPEI." Hence does it mean that for SPEI they have considered data till 2010? I wonder whether the data set can be more than a decade old or am I missing something. An explanation to this effect will be helpful or the authors need to update the data set/ use simulated data set etc.
4. "In this paper, we use 6 months to reflect short-term agricultural drought and 18 months to reflect droughts that affect the hydrological cycle." Any reference for this from the literature?
5. The authors talk about the controls in the regression, but Eq 1 does not show them or it is not clear. It will be important to indicate the control variables in the regression model.
6. The overall work by the authors is exciting and current. It has major implications for policy making and livelihood development, especially in the context of agri based societies and the developing world. However, if the authors can also weave the work with the theories of migration/ or any such work it will enhance the contribution of the work manifold.



Thanks and all the best!