

Review of: "Finding the illuminance levels for walkers in a prominent public park in New Delhi during the post-twilight period for healthy visual comfort, security, and other related parameters."

Vincent Boucher

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Here are some comments that I hope will be helpful:

Title :

« other related parameters » seems blurry

Keywords :

CPTED is used but not defined

Abstract :

on what are based the recommendations for uniformity or lighting changes ?

Introduction :

there is a repetition : « complete a complete ».

Careful with the word « brightness ». As a scientific paper (and not a popularization), illuminance can't be associated directly with luminance (or brightness) as it depends on surface reflexion properties (that also depend on environmental conditions).

"Security has a significant component of actual security" : repetition, find another wording

« the above standards from the literature » : There are no standards in the presented literature, only many examples in particular conditions (and probably different pavements, so that illuminance levels are difficult to compare).

Materials and methods:

Levels are derived but not given. Values in lux should be provided.

« This method ~~has been~~ will be mentioned in detail below »

The type of lighting could also be mentioned in this part.

Results :

“some points had zero lux as the reading » and as said before the luxmeter « has the least count of 1 lux ». The question is then : These points was not lit or lit with a value below the threshold of the instrument ? It also surprising, that values are given as integers without any digits after the decimal point.

I'm not sure to understand the figure 3 : Columns represent values every 10 steps? why such a difference in the number of measurements?

“the illumination values were 28 and the maximum peaking up to 174” : add unities.

Discussion :

Recommendations are of common sense based on the non-uniformity of the measured values. But a much more refined analysis could be made with respect to walkers' feelings.