

Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Dr Kamal Sarma

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Reviewer's Comments:

Title: Estimating the Fish Stocks of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon

It is a well-studied and well-written manuscript of practical importance. A few points are mentioned below and may be addressed to provide a better understanding for readers and researchers.

- Cumulative effort, mean effort, & accumulated effort are mentioned in the text. What they are and how they were calculated is not clear. For each species, it was different. Please explain the logic behind that.
- MSY is shown in the graph, but nowhere is it mentioned from which data it was calculated or how the current yield is calculated. Is it for one species or all six species?
- "After reaching the MSY, the catchability will tend to decrease, even if we continue to increase the effort, marking the point where fishermen should stop the activity and give time for the stocks to recover (Martell and Froese, 2012)." It is a general and well-established understanding. The value of MSY for each species may be included, which will have practical use.
- The r^2 (coefficient of determination) value in all cases is very low. This indicates that CPUE is not at all dependent upon accumulated effort. Hence, no concrete relationship can be derived from that. Please justify.
- Statement: "The ideal would be to generate one regression for each capture site separately; however, given the small historical series, there are not enough entries to do so." It is not clear. Please explain.
- Please explain the "capturability index."
- "In light of this, our results suggest that the species *P. nigricans* and *P. punctifer* still haven't reached the MSY" – There is no information in the text about the species *P. punctifer*, except in one place as cited above.
- "We observe that less than 7% is currently being explored" – how the conclusion has been derived is not clear. As it is a very sensitive issue and the exploitation rate will depend on this information, please explain in detail.

Final recommendation: May be accepted after addressing all the queries.