

Review of: "Planetary consciousness incites probably transcendent feelings and deepens the polarization of worldviews"

Íñigo Ongay De Felipe¹

¹ Universidad de Deusto

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This manuscript offers an overtly speculative idea, which seems to be extremely difficult (in fact impossible) to verify or falsify by referring to actual evidence supporting it. While such a speculative character by itself does not count as an objection against the claim, the authors should at least attempt to construct an argument showing why the rather far-fetched notion they defend may be plausible conceptually. They do in fact very little by means of that, although the paper contains a discussion of some phenomena that allegedly could point to the truth of the hypothesis. The reader is left wondering if the hypothesis of the emergence of a planetary system of consciousness is merely ad-hoc, in that it seems that the “evidence” invoked in its favor only “backs up” the claim because such evidence has in turn previously been interpreted by the authors as being “manifestations” of the “planetary consciousness”. The fact however remains that all the developments cited here could find other much more natural interpretations. This circular line of reasoning is of course fallacious.

Whereas my previous observation is important, there is something else to take into account. Some of the shreds of evidence the manuscript discusses (apparitions and miracles) are very dubious to say the least, as these “phenomena” themselves lack evidence and are very far from being well established irrespective of what many of the “witnesses” may report (there will always be people asserting having experienced anything).

In terms of the scholarship of the article, I am surprised that while the authors consider Teilhard de Chardin’s notion of the noosphere, no mention is made of some other previous articulations of the same idea: Plato’s views on the world soul in *Timaeus*, and later on Neoplatonic and Stoic ideas on a universal nous regulating the functioning of the universe.