

# Review of: "Evaluating Hydrologic, Geomorphic, and Vegetation Parameters to Assess Natural, Living, and Hardened Shorelines along the Northern Gulf of Mexico"

Wyatt Maddox<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> University of Victoria

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Overall, the article is well constructed and clear in its purpose. The goals of the study are relevant to current trends in shoreline protection strategies. Concepts were well explained and the authors provided an appropriate amount of background information to the audience.

Some feedback for the article:

1. In general, the language used is simplistic and could be made more succinct to convey information at a higher academic level.
2. The abstract lacked specifics expected to engage the audience; in particular, some quantified results.
3. In the section on Hardened Shorelines in the Introduction, several statements are made quite broadly without further explanation. I recommend providing more substance to statements such as "saltmarshes have declined" and "increased sediment grain size nearshore can negatively affect vegetation." More context is needed for these concepts.
4. Within the Methods section, the Vegetation Surveys should include more robust information on what was gathered and how these were conducted. The following section, Data Analysis, included that information on "species richness, average percent cover, and diversity" was statistically evaluated, but does not specify if this is all the information that was collected on vegetation and how.
5. The Results section includes some data that was not mentioned in the Methods section. Under Geomorphic Features, wind data is discussed; however, no mention of a source or method of collection is included.
6. Vegetation data results include quantification of cover without explanation of how this was determined. Specify qualitative observation or image classification, or another methodology within the appropriate section.
7. There is a brief methodological explanation for the wind data in the Discussion section under Geomorphic Features. A robust section within the Methods is needed for this data.

