

Review of: "Inclusive Academic Advising for students with mental health issues. The views and experiences of Academic Advisors"

David Cawthorpe¹

¹ University of Calgary

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Thank you for the opportunity to review the paper titled "Inclusive Academic Advising for students with mental health issues. The views and experiences of Academic Advisors."

The paper employs a qualitative analysis of a survey of 52% or less of academic advisors across four faculties (representing ~25%) in terms of their expressions related to addressing the mental health aspects of the students to which they provide academic advice.

Of note is that while the sample is analyzable in terms of the qualitative methods described it may be biased in other ways. For example, is there a mental health service within the SU (not described). Is dealing with the mental health of the academic advice-seeking students part of the survey-responding academic advisors or are there other resources designed to deal with such issues to which academic advisors might refer students presenting with mental issues of student (not described)?

There might be 220 faculty at SU in these faculties based on the reported percentages, and the faculty responding to the survey are not immune to their own mental health issues and the probability of their open-ended responses to the survey being influenced by this factor.

A copy of the survey would be useful.

Some specific issues:

Abstract

1. At the outset, you may want to respect Strunk and White's *The Elements of Style* and spell out the acronym AA at every occurrence, as searches for AA may frequently bring up Alcoholics Anonymous instead your paper.
2. "Study University" is capitalized. Is it a real university or a way of keeping the name of the studied university anonymous? If the latter, you do not need the capitals.
3. In the phrase "the four faculty" should not the word faculty be plural in its initial and next use?
4. The phrase "students' support" might be better understood as "support of students".
5. In the phrase "The disparity in how AAs perceived their role" might be pluralized to be more consistent with the prior use of the word 'roles' in the previous use of this word.
6. The word "fulfil" might be pluralized to agree with the previous verb.

Introduction

1. Use the proper APA format for the first reference to HEFCE, it is hard to find in the references as it is not listed in that manner.
2. Define "specific learning difference"
3. This sentence is grammatically incorrect "There are some indications that these support services are useful in alleviating students' emotional distress (Broglia et 2021) However," as there is no period before the word "However", yet that word is capitalized. Further, in this sentence the reference refers to a two-year sample of students completing dimensional surveys of potential mental health issues over only two years which in the history of important mental health problems (which are usually beyond the bailiwick of 'academic' counsellors). For example, we analyzed suicidality in a large population from 2010-2021 related to COVID and found no increases higher than 2014-2016.
4. It is unclear if there are other differentiated levels of intervention specifically for mental and pastoral issues in the SU. The structure of academic, mental health or pastoral support is not clearly described. If there is none then this is a serious issue for the SU, but the structure of student support services was not described to the extent that this issue was assessable in the paper.

Conclusions

1. Jumping to the conclusions drawn, the salutogenic issues versus diagnostic issues that impair academic performance possibly represent a false dichotomy when it comes to identifying and dealing with bonified mental health issues that are different from general salutogenic distress-related issues.
2. A copy of the survey might be useful.