Qeios

Peer Review

Review of: "PSO and the Traveling Salesman Problem: An Intelligent Optimization Approach"

Kemal Kilic[1]

1. Aalborg University, Aalborg, Denmark

Thanks for sharing the preprint.

The idea of the paper is interesting but not a novel one. Check the paper, for example: "Kang-Ping Wang, Lan Huang, Chun-Guang Zhou and Wei Pang, "Particle swarm optimization for traveling salesman problem," Proceedings of the 2003 International Conference on Machine Learning and Cybernetics (IEEE Cat. No.03EX693), Xi'an, 2003, pp. 1583-1585 Vol.3, doi: 10.1109/ICMLC.2003.1259748".

The standard TSP datasets are not used, like the TSPLIB (http://comopt.ifi.uni-heidelberg.de/software/TSPLIB95/). So the possible comparative performance improvement of the proposed method cannot be assessed.

Authors may research the approximation ratio and check the secondary performance metrics (other than tour length) like Average Waiting Time (assuming a certain value for the speed or considering it as Average Waiting Distance) or Running Time. But for this type of benchmarking, the standard TSP data sets should be utilized. The proposed method should be compared to the existing methods.

Other population-based approximation heuristics should be investigated to see comparative performance metrics.

The structure of the preprint is good, and further work can be added on top of it.

Although the article has a promising future, overall it still requires a bit more work to become scientifically sound and publishable work.

doi.org/10.32388/M2UX5M

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.