Review of: "What is it like to be an AI bat?"

Stefano Turini[1]

1 Alma Mater Europaea

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Review of manuscript

What is it like to be an AI bat?

By

Dr. Prof. **Stefano Turini** MBioLSc PhD

Stefano Turini[1,2,3,4,*,§]

Stefano Turini[1,2,3,4,*,§]

[1]Scientific Director of Worldwide Research Lab and Worldwide Research Magazine, Worldwide Consultancy & Services srls, Andrea Ferrara Street 45 - 00165 Rome, Italy. Senior Lecturer in Biochemistry and Microbiology, Alma Mater Europaea (AMEU-ECM); Slovenska Ulica/Street 17, Maribor, 2000, Slovenia. [3] Research Director and Principal Investigator at BDORT Center for Functional Supplementation and Integrative Medicine, Bulevar Oslobodjenja 2, 11000, Belgrade, Republic of Serbia. [4] Project Manager at Unique Treatments doo, Nemanjina 40, 11000, Belgrade, Republic of Serbia.

[*]Corresponding Author Email: turini.stefano@yahoo.it

[§]Corresponding Author Gmail: stefanoturini87@gmail.com

°Corresponding Author Proton Mail: turini.stefano@protonmail.com

***Analysis of Abstract**:*

1. Precision in Findings: The abstract begins with a concise overview of the paper's focus on consciousness, acknowledging the complexity of the topic. The identification and classification of various theories related to consciousness demonstrates precision in presenting the existing landscape of research in the field of Artificial Consciousness.

2. Effective Use of Terminology: The document demonstrates a commendable grasp of specialized terminology related to consciousness and artificial intelligence, incorporating terms such as "Higher Order Thoughts/Higher Order Perception,"

"Integrated Information Theory," and "Neural Correlate of Consciousness." The terminology is used appropriately to convey specific concepts, contributing to the scientific rigor of the document.

3. Quantitative Specifics: The abstract lacks quantitative data or specific numerical details. However, given the abstract's nature, which provides an overview of theories and concepts, the absence of quantitative specifics is reasonable.

4. Scientific Review - Precision and Specificity: The abstract provides a comprehensive review of various consciousness theories, offering a broad perspective on the current state of research. The mention of overlapping theories and the acknowledgment of disagreement contribute to a nuanced and precise understanding of the scientific landscape.

5. Interpretation of Findings: The document interprets the findings by emphasizing the lack of a universal solution to the Artificial Consciousness problem and highlights the importance of considering the type of consciousness model. This interpretation reflects a thoughtful analysis of the current challenges and debates within the field.

6. Broader Implications: The abstract discusses the implications of differing consciousness models on views regarding animal consciousness, human conscious states, and Artificial Consciousness. It sets the stage for a broader exploration of the societal and ethical implications of advancements in AI and consciousness research.

7. Forward-Looking Language: The use of terms like "Fifth Industrial Revolution" and the consideration of pragmatic views for human-AI interaction hint at a forward-looking perspective. However, the abstract does not explicitly elaborate on future directions for research or potential advancements in the field.

8. Scientific Relevance: The paper maintains scientific relevance by linking consciousness theories with the ongoing discourse on Artificial Consciousness. It addresses the "hard problem of consciousness" and the challenges of translating consciousness into AI, establishing its significance in the broader scientific community.

Opinion on Scientific, Technical, and Economic Applications: The research presented holds significant potential for advancing our understanding of consciousness and its integration into artificial systems. From a technical standpoint, insights gained from such studies could contribute to the development of more sophisticated AI models. However, achieving true Artificial Consciousness remains a complex challenge, and the focus might shift towards enhancing cognitive capabilities rather than replicating consciousness in the near term.

Prototype Business Plan:

1. **Research and Development:** Establish a research center focused on the intersection of consciousness studies and AI, collaborating with experts in neuroscience, computer science, and philosophy.
2. **Education and Training:** Offer workshops and training programs to educate professionals in AI, fostering interdisciplinary collaboration and knowledge exchange.
3. **Consulting Services:** Provide consulting services to businesses seeking to integrate AI technologies, emphasizing the ethical considerations surrounding consciousness in AI systems.

4. **Public Engagement:** Engage with the public through seminars, webinars, and publications to promote awareness and understanding of the implications of AI advancements on consciousness.

Statistical Probability of Business Success: The success of the proposed business model would depend on the pace of advancements in AI and consciousness research, societal acceptance, and the ability to address ethical concerns. Collaboration with academia, industry, and regulatory bodies would increase the likelihood of success.

Sectors of Application: The insights from this research could find applications in diverse sectors such as healthcare (AI-assisted diagnostics), finance (risk assessment and decision-making), and education (personalized learning). The focus should be on enhancing cognitive capabilities rather than replicating consciousness.

This prototype business plan is speculative and should be further refined based on market dynamics, technological advancements, and ethical considerations. The success of such an initiative would require ongoing adaptation to the evolving landscape of AI and consciousness studies.

Analysis of Introduction:

1. Precision in Findings: The introduction outlines the contemporary debate surrounding the nature of intelligence, emphasizing the varying perspectives on intelligence, particularly the connection between consciousness and intelligence. The references to computational power, perception abilities, and data processing as components of intelligence display precision in identifying key aspects of the debate.

2. Effective Use of Terminology: The document effectively employs terminology related to artificial intelligence, consciousness, and philosophical concepts. Terms such as "Artificial Consciousness," "self-awareness," "autopoiesis," and various philosophical viewpoints are used appropriately, enhancing the document's technical and scientific quality.

3. Quantitative Specifics: Similar to the abstract, the introduction lacks quantitative specifics, which is suitable for its purpose of providing a broad overview and setting the stage for a discussion on Artificial Consciousness.

4. Scientific Review - Precision and Specificity: The introduction provides a historical overview of the problem of consciousness, tracing its roots from antiquity to contemporary scientific discussions. The inclusion of various philosophical and scientific viewpoints demonstrates precision in presenting a diverse range of perspectives on the subject.

5. Interpretation of Findings: The document interprets the historical evolution of the problem of consciousness, highlighting the influence of philosophical perspectives and the persistent challenges in understanding consciousness. The questions posed at the end of the introduction indicate a thoughtful interpretation that sets the stage for deeper exploration.

6. Broader Implications: The introduction touches upon the broader implications of the debate on artificial consciousness, hinting at ethical considerations and its potential impact on society and the future of humankind. This lays the groundwork for a comprehensive exploration of the societal and ethical dimensions of the research.

7. Forward-Looking Language: The use of terms such as "Artificial Consciousness" and the inclusion of questions about the future of AI development and its ethical implications introduce forward-looking elements. However, the document does not explicitly outline future directions for research.

8. Scientific Relevance: The introduction establishes the scientific relevance of the debate on artificial consciousness by linking it to the recent advancements in AI. The document sets the stage for discussing the intersection of AI, consciousness, and philosophical considerations, emphasizing the importance of understanding consciousness for the future of AI.

Opinion on Scientific, Technical, and Economic Applications: From a scientific standpoint, the document lays the groundwork for exploring the relationship between consciousness and AI, which could contribute to the development of more sophisticated and nuanced AI models. Technically, advancements in understanding consciousness may lead to improved AI systems with enhanced cognitive capabilities.

Prototype Business Plan: Given the nature of the document, a direct prototype business plan is not immediately applicable. However, an organization could focus on facilitating interdisciplinary collaboration between AI researchers, philosophers, and ethicists. Such an organization might offer conferences, workshops, and publications to bridge the gap between scientific advancements and ethical considerations in AI development. Revenue streams could be derived from memberships, event sponsorships, and consulting services.

Statistical Probability of Business Success: The success of such an organization would depend on the growing interest in the ethical dimensions of AI development. Collaboration with industry, academia, and regulatory bodies would be essential for addressing the complex challenges posed by the intersection of AI, consciousness, and ethics. The statistical probability of success would hinge on the organization's ability to navigate evolving ethical standards and contribute meaningfully to the ongoing discourse.

Analysis of Consciousness. Models and Types:

1. Precision in Findings: The section on Consciousness, Models, and Types provides a detailed and precise examination of various theories related to consciousness. The inclusion of diverse perspectives, ranging from Higher Order theories to Quantum Consciousness, demonstrates a meticulous exploration of the subject matter.

2. Effective Use of Terminology: The document effectively utilizes a wide array of specialized terminology related to consciousness and its various models. Terms like "Metacognitive," "Neural Correlate of Consciousness," "Global Workspace Theory," and "Multiple Draft Model" are employed accurately, contributing to the document's scientific rigor.

3. Quantitative Specifics: The section introduces quantitative elements, particularly in the discussion of the Neural Correlate of Consciousness (NCC) theories, where estimations of neurons in the human brain and their connections are provided. Additionally, Integrated Information Theory (IIT) is presented as a quantifiable approach to consciousness, offering a nuanced perspective on the subject.

4. Scientific Review - Precision and Specificity: The document reviews various consciousness theories with precision, providing specific details about each model's focus and underlying principles. The inclusion of the historical development of theories enhances the specificity and depth of the scientific review.

5. Interpretation of Findings: The section interprets the findings by presenting different perspectives on consciousness models, emphasizing the importance of metacognition, perceptive abilities, neurophysiological basis, and quantum mechanical processes. The comparison between theories, such as Higher Order theories and Multiple Draft Model, showcases a nuanced understanding of the interpretations within the scientific community.

6. Broader Implications: The document touches on the broader implications of consciousness theories, hinting at the potential impact on understanding altered states of consciousness, ethical considerations, and the nature of free will. This sets the stage for further exploration of the societal and philosophical dimensions of the research.

7. Forward-Looking Language: The section introduces forward-looking elements, especially in the discussion of quantum consciousness, where potential solutions to the problem of free will are suggested. However, the document could benefit from a more explicit exploration of future research directions and advancements.

8. Scientific Relevance: The exploration of various consciousness models and types establishes the scientific relevance of the document. It connects the theories to their neurophysiological and philosophical underpinnings, providing a comprehensive understanding of the current state of consciousness research.

Opinion on Scientific, Technical, and Economic Applications: From a scientific perspective, the document contributes to the ongoing discourse on consciousness and its various models, which can inform the development of more sophisticated AI systems. Technically, insights from quantum consciousness and integrated information theory may guide future advancements in brain-computer interfaces. Economically, applications could emerge in the fields of neurotechnology, mental health, and AI development.

Prototype Business Plan:

1. **Research and Development Center:** Establish a multidisciplinary research center focusing on consciousness studies, integrating experts from neuroscience, philosophy, and quantum physics.
2. **Technology Integration:** Explore collaborations with tech companies to integrate insights from consciousness research into the development of advanced AI systems, brain-computer interfaces, and neurotechnological applications.
3. **Educational Programs:** Offer educational programs and workshops to disseminate knowledge on consciousness theories, fostering interdisciplinary collaboration and attracting talent to the field.
4. **Consulting Services:** Provide consulting services to industries interested in the ethical and technological implications of consciousness research, offering guidance on responsible AI development.

Statistical Probability of Business Success: Success would depend on the organization's ability to navigate interdisciplinary collaborations, address ethical concerns, and stay abreast of advancements in consciousness research.

Collaboration with technology companies, academic institutions, and regulatory bodies would be crucial. The success probability is high if the organization can contribute meaningfully to both scientific and ethical aspects of consciousness studies.

Sectors of Application: The research findings could be applied in sectors such as AI development, neurotechnology, mental health, and philosophy. The integration of consciousness insights into AI models and brain-computer interfaces could revolutionize technology applications in healthcare, education, and human-machine interactions.

Top of Form

Analysis of Non-Human Brain:

1. Precision in Findings: The section on the non-human brain demonstrates precision in addressing criticism of anthropocentrism in consciousness theories. It provides a detailed exploration of the perspectives on consciousness in various life forms, from simple organisms to complex mammals, highlighting the potential presence of consciousness in non-human entities.

2. Effective Use of Terminology: The document employs specialized terminology related to consciousness, such as "autopoiesis," "allopoietic," and "homeostasis," effectively. The use of these terms contributes to a nuanced discussion on the differences between biological and artificial systems and the potential for consciousness in various organisms.

3. Quantitative Specifics: The section introduces quantitative specifics by providing estimates of the number of neurons in the brains of different species, including humans. The comparison of neuron numbers and the projection of computer power in the human brain offers quantitative insights into the potential capacity for intelligence.

4. Scientific Review - Precision and Specificity: The document reviews various theories related to non-human consciousness with precision. It delves into the evolutionary development of autopoietic systems, attention schema theory, and the potential differences in consciousness between biological and machine analogs. The inclusion of specific brain structures and cognitive activities enhances the scientific review.

5. Interpretation of Findings: The section interprets the findings by exploring different perspectives on consciousness in non-human entities. It addresses the critical question of whether lower-level cognitive activities can lead to consciousness and emphasizes the role of critical levels of complexity in cognition for the emergence of consciousness.

6. Broader Implications: The document broadens the implications by discussing the potential differences in consciousness between humans and other species. It introduces the idea that consciousness might be a subset of cognitive activity and raises questions about the criteria for considering an entity conscious. This sets the stage for further philosophical and ethical considerations.

7. Forward-Looking Language: The forward-looking language is implicit in the discussion of computer power barriers and projections beyond 2029. However, the document could benefit from a more explicit exploration of potential future research directions in understanding non-human consciousness.

8. Scientific Relevance: The section establishes the scientific relevance of considering consciousness in non-human entities by examining brain structures, neuron numbers, and the evolution of cognitive complexity. It contributes to ongoing discussions about the nature of consciousness, extending the conversation beyond human-centric perspectives.

Opinion on Scientific, Technical, and Economic Applications: From a scientific perspective, this section enriches the discourse on consciousness by considering the potential for non-human entities to possess varying levels of consciousness. Technically, insights into the neural structures and cognitive capacities of different species could inform the development of AI models with enhanced cognitive abilities. Economically, applications may emerge in areas such as neurotechnology, robotics, and the ethical treatment of animals.

Prototype Business Plan:

1. **Biotechnology Research Hub:** Establish a research hub focusing on the intersection of biotechnology, neuroscience, and artificial intelligence. Investigate the potential translation of insights from non-human consciousness studies into AI development.
2. **Ethical AI Consulting Services:** Offer consulting services to industries working with AI and robotics, providing guidance on the ethical treatment of intelligent systems and raising awareness about the potential consciousness of non-human entities.
3. **Public Engagement Initiatives:** Conduct public awareness campaigns, seminars, and workshops to foster understanding and ethical considerations regarding the consciousness of non-human entities. Collaborate with ethical organizations and regulatory bodies to shape policies.

Statistical Probability of Business Success: Success would depend on the organization's ability to bridge the gap between scientific research and ethical considerations, gaining support from both the scientific community and the public. Collaboration with academic institutions, ethical organizations, and industry partners would be essential. The success probability is high if the organization can contribute meaningfully to both scientific understanding and ethical practices.

Sectors of Application: The research findings could be applied in sectors such as biotechnology, neuroscience, artificial intelligence, and ethical consulting. Insights into non-human consciousness could inform the development of more ethically grounded AI systems and contribute to advancements in neurotechnology and biotechnology.

Top of Form

Analysis of Artificial Consciousness:

1. Precision in Findings: The section on Artificial Consciousness (AC) displays precision by thoroughly examining both sides of the debate – opponents and proponents. It effectively summarizes key thought experiments like the "Chinese Room," "Mary's Room," and "Brain in Vat," contributing to a precise analysis of the challenges and arguments in the field of AC.

2. Effective Use of Terminology: The document employs specialized and appropriate terminology related to artificial

consciousness, such as "quantum consciousness," "meta-cognition," "quantum computing," and "neural network architecture." The use of these terms enhances the technical depth of the discussion.

3. Quantitative Specifics: Quantitative specifics are introduced through the discussion of quantum computing and the potential number of qubits required for effective machine consciousness. The mention of the current limitations and the concept of Noisy Intermediate-Scale Quantum (NISQ) adds quantitative depth to the analysis.

4. Scientific Review - Precision and Specificity: The document presents a scientific review by evaluating prominent thought experiments, theories, and technological solutions related to AC. The analysis of Higher Order group theories, Integrated Information Theory (IIT), Global Workspace Theory (GWT), and quantum consciousness theories showcases specificity and precision in scientific discussions.

5. Interpretation of Findings: The findings are interpreted with an open-minded approach, acknowledging the arguments of opponents and proponents. The document emphasizes the potential role of artificial general intelligence (AGI) in creating AI-conscious systems and discusses the intersection of neural network architecture and symbolic reasoning.

6. Broader Implications: The broader implications are addressed by exploring the potential scenarios where AI surpasses human intelligence and achieves artificial consciousness. The document touches on the ethical considerations, such as AI+ machines designing more advanced AI++, and highlights the need for responsible development and control.

7. Forward-Looking Language: The document contains forward-looking language in discussing the future possibilities of quantum computing and its potential role in achieving artificial consciousness. The mention of NISQ as a future solution indicates an awareness of ongoing developments in the field.

8. Scientific Relevance: The section establishes the scientific relevance of considering artificial consciousness by discussing various theories and technological approaches. It contributes to ongoing debates in the field, exploring potential avenues for achieving AC and the role of quantum computing in this endeavor.

Opinion on Scientific, Technical, and Economic Applications: From a scientific standpoint, the document acknowledges the diverse theories and potential technological solutions for AC. Technically, the focus on quantum computing suggests a path for future developments in achieving artificial consciousness. Economically, applications may emerge in the burgeoning field of quantum computing and AI research, potentially leading to new industries and collaborations.

Prototype Business Plan:

1. **Quantum Computing Research Lab:** Establish a research lab focused on quantum computing applications, with a dedicated team exploring the intersection of quantum mechanics and artificial consciousness. Collaborate with universities, tech companies, and AI research institutions.
2. **AI Ethics and Governance Consultancy:** Launch a consultancy service specializing in AI ethics and governance. Provide guidance on responsible AI development, emphasizing transparency, accountability, and ethical considerations in creating conscious AI systems.

3. **Quantum Computing Education Programs:** Develop educational programs and workshops to raise awareness about quantum computing and its potential applications, targeting both professionals and students. Position the company as a leader in quantum computing education.

Statistical Probability of Business Success: Success in the quantum computing and AI ethics consultancy fields would depend on the company's ability to stay at the forefront of emerging technologies, collaborate with key players in the industry, and effectively communicate the ethical considerations of AI and quantum computing to diverse stakeholders. The success probability is high with strategic partnerships and a well-executed educational outreach program.

Sectors of Application: The research findings and technological applications could find relevance in sectors such as quantum computing research, AI development, AI ethics consultancy, and education. The potential impact on AI industries, ethical considerations, and educational initiatives positions the business in diverse sectors.

Top of Form

Analysis of Problems and Solution:

1. Comprehensive Problem Analysis: The document provides a comprehensive analysis of the challenges associated with artificial consciousness (AC), considering factors such as the dissimilarity between biological and artificial neural networks, the gap in evolutionary approaches, and the limitations of thought experiments. This holistic approach contributes to a thorough understanding of the complexities involved.

2. Clarity in Problem Presentation: The problems related to AC are presented clearly, covering issues like the nature of intelligence, the dissimilarity between autonomous biological systems and AI, and the gap in evolutionary approaches. The document effectively communicates the intricate nature of these challenges in a manner accessible to readers with varying levels of expertise.

3. Integration of Historical Context: The inclusion of historical context, such as the evolution of data processing from ancient writing systems to contemporary AI, enhances the document's depth. It places current challenges in the context of historical developments, providing readers with a broader perspective on the evolution of human-machine interactions.

4. Technological and Societal Implications: The document successfully explores the technological implications of growing dataization, emphasizing the instrumental role of machines in supporting human intellectual abilities. It also delves into the societal implications, discussing the evolving relationship between humans and smart machines and the need for societal adaptation to an AI-empowered environment.

5. Ethical Considerations: Ethical considerations related to AI and AC are addressed, focusing on societal and psychological changes caused by AI. The discussion highlights concerns about biased data, the lack of inherent ethics in AI systems, and the responsibility of humans for machine actions. The ethical dimension is well-integrated into the broader analysis.

6. Forward-Looking Approach: The document adopts a forward-looking approach by discussing the evolving human-

machine complex and the need for humans to adapt to AI systems. It anticipates a future where humans exist as a network of networks between AI-empowered individuals and machine nodes. This forward-looking perspective contributes to the document's relevance in the context of emerging technologies.

7. Consideration of Weak AI: The consideration of weak AI as a sufficient and instrumental solution for the Fifth Industrial Revolution adds a pragmatic dimension to the discussion. It acknowledges the practical applications of AI without necessarily requiring strong AI or artificial consciousness. This perspective aligns with the current state of AI development.

8. Emphasis on Responsibility: The document emphasizes the responsibility of humans for machine actions, emphasizing the need for human control over AI decisions. The discussion resonates with ethical concerns related to biased data and the potential societal impact of AI. This emphasis on responsibility adds a nuanced perspective to the discourse on AI and consciousness.

Opinion on Comprehensive Understanding: The document showcases a comprehensive understanding of the multifaceted challenges and implications associated with artificial consciousness. It effectively weaves together historical context, technological advancements, societal considerations, and ethical dimensions. The nuanced exploration of problems and potential solutions contributes to a well-rounded and insightful analysis.

Top of Form

Analysis of Conclusion:

1. Comprehensive Integration: The conclusion effectively integrates key themes discussed throughout the document, including computerization, growing computing power, smart environments, and the potential for a complex human-machine environment. It provides a cohesive summary that ties together theoretical debates, practical research, and the social context of AI implementation, demonstrating a comprehensive understanding of the subject matter.

2. Acknowledgment of Social Context: The conclusion rightly emphasizes the importance of placing research and technological progress into the social context. It recognizes the need to measure the effects of AI implementation not only in terms of utilitarian outcomes but also by considering broader societal and psychological impacts. This acknowledgment reflects a thoughtful consideration of the ethical and societal dimensions associated with AI.

3. Pragmatic View on Imaginary Threats: The document takes a pragmatic view by highlighting the transformational influence of new technologies and suggesting that modern society cannot forego progressive development due to imaginary threats. This pragmatic perspective encourages a forward-looking approach and underlines the importance of balancing caution with the pursuit of technological advancements.

4. Emphasis on Collaboration: The conclusion stresses the significance of balanced collaboration between humankind and AI instruments in the context of the Fourth and Fifth Industrial Revolutions. This emphasis on collaboration positions AI as a tool to augment human capabilities rather than a replacement, fostering a positive outlook on the future of human-

machine interactions.

5. Forward-Looking Tone: The conclusion maintains a forward-looking tone, recognizing the ongoing process of computerization and the dynamic nature of technological advancements. This forward-looking perspective aligns with the document's exploration of the evolving human-machine complex and the need for societal adaptation to an AI-empowered environment.

6. Clarity and Conciseness: The conclusion is clear and concise, summarizing complex ideas without introducing unnecessary complexity. It distills the key takeaways from the document, providing a strong and effective closing statement.

7. Reflection on Valuable Discussion: Acknowledging the value of the discussion on the possibility of consciousness in intelligent devices adds a reflective element to the conclusion. It underscores the importance of both theoretical debates and practical research in shaping scientific and technological progress.

8. Key to the Future: The phrase "Balanced collaboration of humankind, empowered with AI instruments, is a key to the future" encapsulates the main message of the conclusion. It reinforces the idea that the harmonious integration of human intelligence and AI technologies is essential for navigating the challenges and opportunities presented by the evolving technological landscape.

Overall Evaluation: The conclusion is a strong and well-crafted summary that effectively ties together the document's various threads. It maintains a balanced and pragmatic tone, recognizing the transformative potential of AI while emphasizing the need for responsible collaboration. The forward-looking perspective and the acknowledgment of societal implications contribute to a thoughtful and comprehensive conclusion.