

Review of: "Cambrian Chordates and Early Fin Evolution"

John Videler¹

¹ University of Groningen

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

In the 'new version' Mark McMenamin ignores most of the serious remarks I made regarding the first attempt. Not even the obvious mistake in the caption of figure 1 ('possible possible') has been changed.

So once again in summary:

The author removed a little piece of matrix from a fossil he described in a previous article.

The stone surface exposed shows no particular structure not even under SEM.

Without any argument or proof the nondescript structure is declared to indicate the existence of a 'ventral fin ray box'.

The manuscript ends by showing two artist impressions of reconstructions of the whole animal. These are hilarious cartoons with no indication or arguments on what evidences they are based. No explanation of the details is given.

This manuscript is based on nothing at all and does not confirm with a serious scientific publication; it is a sham and should not be published.