Review of: "Classical Explanation of Absorption Spectra"

Kamrun N. Keya[1]

1 North Dakota State University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Review of "Classical Explanation of Absorption Spectra" by G. H. Jadhav

Clarity and Structure

The article begins with an abstract that sets a clear direction, detailing the exploration of absorption spectra in a gas-filled chamber. The introduction provides a thorough historical and technical context, setting up the stage effectively for the main content. The document is structured into logical sections that flow from one to another, facilitating an easy follow-through of the concepts presented.

Content and Scientific Rigor

The core of the article delves into a hypothetical experiment designed to investigate absorption spectra through classical and quantum mechanics perspectives. This section is well-elaborated, incorporating both theoretical underpinnings and experimental setup, which provides a comprehensive understanding of the proposed phenomena.

However, the discussion around atomic models and their implications on electron behavior in absorption spectra is quite speculative. The critique of existing models like the Rutherford-Bohr model and the introduction of alternative ideas such as the "spin atomic model" are bold and innovative but lack empirical backing within the document. The assertions made about electron behavior and the deficiencies of current atomic theories require more rigorous validation through either experimental data or more robust theoretical analysis.

Novelty and Contribution

The article presents an interesting hypothesis on the behavior of electrons during the absorption process which challenges traditional views and suggests an alternative mechanism involving fixed electron positions and natural frequencies. This novel approach could potentially offer new insights into spectroscopic analysis if further explored and substantiated with empirical evidence.

Language and Readability

The language used is generally formal and appropriate for a scientific paper. However, there are occasional grammatical errors and some sentences are complex, which might hinder readability slightly. Simplifying these complex sentences and improving the grammar could make the paper more accessible to a broader audience.

Figures and References

The document includes references to prior studies and important works, which helps in establishing the scientific foundation of the claims. The figures, particularly the experimental setup, are described well but would benefit from

higher-quality illustrations for better clarity.

Overall Assessment

The article is ambitious and presents a provocative viewpoint that challenges established norms in the field of spectroscopy. While it is theoretically intriguing, its claims are significantly speculative without the support of concrete experimental evidence. For future revisions, the author might consider incorporating data from actual experiments or simulations to substantiate the proposed models. Additionally, enhancing the clarity of the figures and refining the language will improve the paper's impact and readability.

Overall, this is a thought-provoking article that contributes to the ongoing discourse in spectroscopy and atomic physics. With further development and rigorous validation, it has the potential to make a significant impact on how absorption spectra are understood and analyzed.