

Review of: "The Traumas of Displacement and Not Belonging"

Sarah Mohammed¹

¹ University of Saskatchewan

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Hello Susan Schwartz,

Thank you for sharing your work. The article provides an interesting exploration of the relationship between trauma and displacement. Although there is much previous work on this relationship, the particular lens you provide is intricate. I have provided a few suggestions that may help strengthen the work.

- **Some background on the conceptual framework:** I am unfamiliar with the Jungian analytical methodology, so I would appreciate an in-depth explanation of how the experiences you unpack have been approached, especially concerning Jung's conceptualization of trauma and belonging. I am particularly interested in learning more about what you mean when you incorporate the analysis of dreams, as well as the discussion of soul and spirit.
- **Describe the vignettes origin:** Pivoting the analysis on specific cases and experiences of transnational displacement was a great way to ground the abstract concepts in lived experience. However, I found myself wondering where these experiences came from. A description of the origin of the vignettes or how they were retrieved may answer these questions.
- **Clarify the relationship between psychology and context:** The work often describes the sense of belonging (or, rather, not belonging) experienced by the displaced people, but blends discussion of interpersonal belonging with institutional belonging. I found myself wondering to what extent the forces that create the state of "not belonging" are crafted by the state and are crafted by the community. Further, a clear outline of the contextual factors (both interpersonal and institutional) affecting the peoples' trauma responses can help connect these various responses to specific dimensions of displacement.
- **Define trauma early on:** A clear statement of how you operationalize trauma in this work would be helpful early on, to prepare the reader for the use of the term and its related concepts throughout the later parts of the work.
- **Organization:** There is a wealth of information and worked poured into this paper that captivates my interest, but I found myself struggling to follow a clearly scaffolded path. The headings that were used were helpful to delineate sections, but I was unsure how each section related to the next. Additionally, I appreciate that the final sections argue in favor of the use of Jungian analysis to address traumas associated with transnational displacement. I see the information related to this argument laid out, but the content itself, and the paragraphs leading up to it, could be more directly pointed toward this argument.

Again, I thank you for your paper as it presents an interesting approach to unpacking the traumas of displaced peoples. I



hope my comments can be helpful to you.

Sincerely,

Sarah Mohammed