

Review of: "Alcohol Consumption in Ancient India and the Contemporary Challenges: A Study of Socio-Economic Implications and Anti-Liquor Protests in Tamil Nadu"

Sabah Chaib

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The article is written in clear language and develops an important question. But it looks a little too much like a presentation which intends to address different facets of a subject, in a descriptive way and not relational and problematic enough in the sense of the social sciences. As a previous reviewer points out, it is not clear what the very heart of the subject is with regard to the different aspects addressed by the author or even the way in which the article is constructed does not really respond to the author's stated concerns in the very title of the article, namely "a study of socio-economic implications and anti-liquor protests in Tamil Nadu".

As the author recognizes, the subject is complex and presents itself in multiple approaches. It is undoubtedly to do well that the author takes the time to address different facets of the subject but precisely in doing so, he poses the elements in a way that is too juxtaposed and not dynamic enough, taken into a single problem in order to understand the springs and implications of the subject: rather than addressing different aspects by devoting nearly a page to each, it would undoubtedly be necessary to keep it shorter in order to preserve the most salient facts for the argument and situate them in a plan focused precisely on this very issue.

The problem is precisely given in its title : the socio-economic implications and the question of protest against alcohol in a given locality. Also, we expect a presentation constructed differently which highlights precisely the question of the actors (State, parties, unions, companies, NGOs, men, women etc.) and the role (active/passive, eclipsed, permanent etc.) of the actors in mobilization ("protest"), with regard to the socio-economic implications. The author can be reassured: he addresses these elements but without relating them, which undoubtedly explains the impression of a presentation but no real guiding thread.

We have indeed the impression too much that he puts everything on the same level of analysis even though certain elements can pose a problem. This is the case, for example, with the historical question, as was rightly mentioned by the previous reviewer: it is difficult to establish as the sole analytical framework the ancient prescriptive texts ("Ancient India") and the contemporary period : the historicity of the phenomenon is in reality lacking, a historicity which precisely allows us to understand how depending on the historical periods and places, the theme works differently on society and its actors. Without being a specialist in the Indian area, we know how in other geographical areas, religious texts prohibiting the consumption of alcohol or prohibiting excess consumption according to "schools" act as a cultural prescriptive framework but do not however, uniformly and ahistorically determine the presence and manifestations of alcohol in a given society.

If I may make a suggestion to the author, the wealth of data used by the author makes it possible to address the problem of socio-economic implications by drawing the problematic thread of actors from above/from below (State, parties, unions, businesses, lobbies, NGOs, civil society). The article contains on this subject, without showing it in a salient way, the question of gender and class: we clearly realize when reading his article, how much in the games of actors from above, are deployed stakeholder games that take place on the side of civil society (NGOs for example) and women in particular. This perspective could undoubtedly lead to reversing the story: starting from the top, undoubtedly providing more elements of socio-historical framing around public alcohol policies in a given state, their evolution and reversals due to a local/national context, the construction of the instruments of this public policy (statistical data, care or information centers for example since the author shows that there are many tools to evaluate the socio-demographic implications of alcohol) and their real impact in terms of policy conduct; the use by the different actors of these tools, notably NGOs for example, in the service of the defense of civil society, and of women in particular since the article in reality emphasizes the fate of women with regard to the implications of the influence of alcohol in the couple, in the family, in work, in the social integration of households.

May the author forgive me if it seems to him that I am taking him on a completely different path than his own but let him rest assured : all of this is contained in his article ! It humbly seems to me that what is missing therefore seems to me to be a question of constructing a problem made more salient in order to be able to better order the themes and the varied data that he exposed in his article.