

Review of: "Ecosystem Services Inequality Driven by Agroextractivism in Salamina, Colombia: A Critical Institutional Analysis"

Janis Alcorn¹

¹ University of Manitoba

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This paper provides a thoughtful reflection on the interface between the intention and application of national policies and “green labels” intended to guide sustainable management of natural resources for the good of the citizens (particularly local “peasants”).

The author needs to provide more context for the non-Colombian reader. The demand for more context can be read between the lines in the questions asked by other reviewers. I found that reading another paper by this same author in this Qeios “volume” provided the information about local context that I needed to understand the actual on-the-ground land use and social situation better, which was necessary for me to interpret this paper. The other paper that provided the context necessary for me follow the more theoretical presentation in this paper is entitled “Theorizing the Normalization of Plantation Agriculture in Colombia”. The author should cross-reference that paper early on.

I suggest that it would also be good for the author to add other references to put the paper into broader context; for example, the author mentions that a private capital fund was created but there is no reference; this reference could be added, for example: [Pérez, L.F. and Gómez, M.I. \(2022\), "Public-private strategies to establish a successful avocado export cycle: cases from Colombia", *Journal of Agribusiness in Developing and Emerging Economies* Vol. 12 No. 4, pp. 620-640. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JADEE-11-2021-0275>.](#)

I was left wondering about the role *Narcotraficantes* play in this land and water use conversion, given recent news stories about interdiction of cocaine hidden in Colombian avocado shipments. It is well known that *Narcotraficantes* control the avocado growth and trade from Mexico (the world’s largest avocado producer). The consideration of such “informal” power factors could enrich this author’s analysis. I would also suggest, for the non-Colombian reader, the author add a very brief context /background and reference about the long civil war for social justice and the ongoing Peace Process -- particularly as this article focuses on a case of further marginalization of “peasants” by international capital as the war was ending. I like the graphic image under the title - asking us to think about what in this scene is really “green?” and what is really “brown?” – the central tree’s foliage and root color /health gives us an answer to ponder.