

# Review of: "Reducing non-revenue water in Egypt using GIS"

Dr. Abdallah Atef<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Assiut University

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

This document deals with the problem of losses from the water supply system in Egypt. The main objective is to reduce water loss in distribution systems using the geographic information system (GIS). The subject is important, and the manuscript is well-written except for a few remarks:

- 1- List the abbreviations and avoid them in the abstract.
- 2- I can't find the use of GIS in the study.
- 2- What is the novelty of the research? What's new?
- 3- The abstract needs to be revised to conclude the research objective, the study technique, and the main results.
- 4- Where are the references in the text?
- 5- The introduction should include a brief summary of past works on the same topic, with references.
- 6- Who measured this 40%? What's the reference?
- 7- The methodology in paragraph form rather than in bullet points.
- 8- Figure 1 is not clear; it doesn't show the location of the study area!
- 9- Separate the methodology from the study area. The study area should be described in a paragraph to avoid any misunderstandings.
- 10- Add the characteristics of the satellite map used in the materials section (type, sensor, spatial resolution, radiometric resolution, etc.).
- 11- Figure 3 must match the others.
- 11- What is the value of figure 4?!!
- 12- Figure 5 is unclear and does not clarify the method used.
- 13- Why is the data used very old (2008 and 2009) when recent data should be used?
- 14- The conclusion needs to be revised.
- 15- I can't find obvious scientific criteria in the research. The paper should be able to add something new. It can't be published in this form. It needs major revisions.