Review of: "Emergent Quantum Gravity"

Shokhan M. Al-Barzinji[1]

1 University of Anbar, Iraq

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The paper provides an interesting and novel perspective on the problem of quantum gravity by leveraging string theory, brane world scenarios, and geometric considerations. The idea of quantum clustering is promising, offering a way to regularize gravity by utilizing higher-dimensional spaces and the unique properties of closed string gravitons. However, the abstract and methodology are highly technical, and some concepts may be difficult to follow without a background in advanced string theory and quantum field theory. The mathematical formulations, particularly the projection operators and integrals, could benefit from further elaboration or examples to make them more accessible to a broader audience. Additionally, while the paper provides a conceptual framework for addressing UV divergences, experimental verification or more explicit connections to existing theories of quantum gravity (like loop quantum gravity or causal dynamical triangulations) would help to solidify its impact in the field.

Here are several points of improvement that could enhance the clarity, depth, and accessibility of the paper "Emergent Quantum Gravity":

1. The concept of quantum clustering is novel but not well defined. A more detailed explanation of how quantum clustering arises from geometric insertions in branes could benefit readers. Specifically, a clearer description of the physical process behind the clustering mechanism (e.g., how gravitons specifically cluster and what this means in practical terms) would make the idea easier to grasp. The discussion on co-dimensions and the geometric insertions could be clarified with concrete examples or diagrams. While Figure 1 provides an abstract visualization, additional context on how co-dimensions interact with branes and how these interactions lead to gravitational clustering would improve comprehension.

2. The mathematical symbols used (such as $\partial|\nabla(p,q)$ or $\partial\sim$) are introduced without sufficient explanation. A more thorough introduction of these symbols, particularly their significance in the context of the paper's framework, would help readers unfamiliar with the advanced mathematical tools. Additionally, the paper could include step-by-step derivations or simplifications of key equations. While the mention of chain and co-chain complexes is important, it would be helpful to give more detail on how these algebraic structures are being applied in this context. Are they just tools for describing the propagation of gravitons, or do they have a deeper role in the regularization process? A clearer link between abstract mathematical structures and their physical interpretation is essential. The relationship between the **geometric insertion** and the **propagator P** could be better explained. The propagator plays a significant role in the cancellation of divergences, but its mechanism and interaction with the branes need to be explicitly outlined. A more concrete mathematical framework or example could help here.

4. The paper discusses theoretical aspects of quantum gravity but does not make a strong connection to experimental data. For instance, how might this model be tested against current observations or future experiments? Mentioning the potential for experimental verification (or how the model might be falsifiable) would give the paper more practical relevance. The paper could benefit from including some preliminary numerical simulations or approximations to demonstrate how the quantum clustering mechanism would work in practice. This could help illustrate how the recoiling process cancels divergences and gives rise to regularized quantum gravity. Including computational results or approximations would ground the abstract concepts in concrete calculations.