

Review of: "Analysing the conglomeration of various urban pockets through the lens of environmental design for crime prevention: A case of Kolkata"

H.R. Khan

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

I would like to express my gratitude for the opportunity to review the manuscript titled [Analysing the conglomeration of various urban pockets through the lens of environmental design for crime prevention: A case of Kolkata](#) by Bose et al.

It's clear that the article focuses on the application of Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) principles in Kolkata, with a specific emphasis on understanding and analyzing the architectural and planning-wise perception of people towards CPTED elements in regard to crime. The study involves three distinct residential areas within Kolkata and employs a detailed methodology for data collection and analysis.

Here is a review of the article:

Strengths:

1. Comprehensive Literature Review: The article provides a thorough background on the concept of CPTED and its relevance in the context of urbanization, crime prevention, and architectural design. It effectively integrates various perspectives from the field of urban planning, architecture, psychology, and criminology.
2. Clear Methodology: The methodology section is well-structured and provides a detailed explanation of how the study was conducted. The selection criteria for the sites, the population survey, and the use of Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) to validate the measurements are clearly outlined.
3. Empirical Data Collection: The article demonstrates a strong commitment to empirical research by conducting face-to-face surveys with a diverse group of respondents, including homeowners, workers, and passersby. This approach ensures a comprehensive understanding of the perspectives of different stakeholders.
4. Appropriate Use of Statistical Techniques: The utilization of Confirmatory Factor Analysis (CFA) to validate the measurements of CPTED elements is a robust methodological choice. It adds credibility to the findings and enhances the reliability of the study.
5. Integration of Urban Context: The article effectively contextualizes the research within the historic and evolving urban fabric of Kolkata. This contextualization is crucial for understanding the complexities and challenges associated with implementing CPTED principles in a specific urban setting.

Areas for Improvement:

1. **Clarity in Presentation:** While the article provides a wealth of information, there are instances where the presentation could be more concise and focused. Some sections might benefit from clearer organization and more direct language.
2. **Further Discussion on Dalan Architecture:** The article briefly touches upon the significance of the Dalan architectural style but could benefit from a deeper exploration of its implications on crime prevention. It would be valuable to understand why Dalans have lost their relevance in terms of security and how this impacts the overall effectiveness of CPTED.
3. **Policy Recommendations:** The article primarily focuses on understanding perceptions and behavioural patterns. It could be strengthened by including practical policy recommendations or design guidelines for urban planners and policymakers to enhance crime prevention in Kolkata.
4. **Visual Aids:** While the article effectively uses figures to illustrate the CFA model, additional visual aids, such as maps or diagrams, could enhance the reader's understanding of the selected sites and their characteristics.

Overall, the article contributes significantly to the discourse on crime prevention in historic, evolving urban areas like Kolkata. The empirical approach, combined with the integration of local context, makes this research a valuable addition to the field of urban planning and criminology. With some refinements in presentation and further discussion on specific architectural elements, the article has the potential to make a significant impact in the academic and practical domains.

Thank You!