

Review of: "Pedogenic Characterization of Alluvium-Derived Soils in the Arid Region of Rajasthan, India"

Laura Paulette¹

¹ University of Agriculture and Veterinary Medicine Cluj-Napoca

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The paper refers to pedogenetical processes in arid conditions of a plain from India. I find the paper lacks both in structure and data. There are some recommendations to consider in order to improve the manuscript:

- The introduction is too short. This part should comprise the hypothesis, importance, and the state of the art of the research, along with the objectives of the research. Please select some key words.
 - A short description of the sites is needed (e.g., distance from the river, vegetation, slopes, parental materials, etc.). The description of the factors of soil formation is very important for pedogenetical processes. The map of the area and also a map of the location of the profiles would bring more support.
 - Several profiles were morphologically studied... How many profiles actually have been described and analysed in the field? Some information about soil classification (classes, type, and subtype of soil) should be provided to add more substance and understanding.
- Also, add the arguments why only three of the soil profiles from the total were selected for further analysis, and the criteria used for selection.
- The climatic constraints restrict pedogenic processes. In which way?
 - The results must be discussed in comparison with other results. Why is this research more important than others? What new findings does this research bring up compared with others? There have to be other previous researches to compare the results with.
 - Table 8, pedon 18 seems to have changed horizons. Starts with Ap horizon and ends with Ap horizon.
 - The paper lacks a final conclusion to emphasise the findings and their importance.
 - The references are scarce and very old. There are so many new references about the approached topic.