

# Review of: "A Calculus of Qualia"

Pavel Baryshnikov

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

The purpose of this article is to attempt to construct a rigorous analytical method for "calculating" the semantics of qualitative (phenomenal) judgments. Despite the generally recognized privacy of qualia, the author builds a consistent model of its logical calculation, based on the concept of "qualifications".

In my opinion, reliance on any of the information theories and the physics of color would bring greater clarity to the material presented. The transition from physics to logic is not fully justified. Does the 700 nm wavelength cause the red color qualia or is it red in itself? Does the denotation of the names "700 nm", "#FF0000" and "red color" coincide, and in which of the worlds does this denotation exist: physical, neurobiological or logical? With such a formulation of the question, the thesis about the identity of materialism and physicalism looks doubtful. Doubt arises precisely because of the irreducibility of a "linguistic thesis" to a "metaphysical thesis" or semantics to ontology. Despite the rigor of the presentation of the material, it is difficult for the reader to understand whether it is about the meaning of linguistic expressions or the real state of affairs in any of the worlds.

At the same time, it is necessary to note the methodological advantages of the work. The dispute between physicalists, dualists, eliminativists, emergentists, etc. about qualia can be translated into a formal language that avoids ambiguities and tautologies. The author himself points to a key and, perhaps, insoluble problem in his approach: "Statements and proofs in qualia calculus involve actual qualia."

At the same time, the proposed solution of difficult problems through the search for neural correlations looks weak. Correlation is a descriptive term with an empirical meaning, while causation is an explanatory term associated with theoretical attempts to understand the nature of correlations.

One can agree with the final conclusion of this paper. Indeed, the article gives a beginning to the calculus of qualia, and this beginning is non-trivial. But the significance of this undertaking has yet to be proven.