

# Review of: "Determinants of Employee Recruitment in Sidama National Regional State, Ethiopia"

Mulugeta Maru<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Addis Ababa University

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.

Review comments on an article entitled

"Determinants of Employee Recruitment in Sidama National Regional State, Ethiopia"

## The general impression of the article:

- The article needs copy-editing to make it appealing to experts.
- The total word count for the abstract section should be at most 300 words.
- The use of a pilot study is appreciated.
- Nearly 80% of the references are recent publications published in the last ten years.
- Use a maximum of ten lines for a paragraph. Too long paragraphs may confuse your reader and cause them to lose the core ideas of the paragraph. For example, the first paragraph of Multi-collinearity Assumption Test sub heading, etc.
- Put reference or source for each Table and Figure used in the paper
- Separate Table and Figure captions from the Tables and Figures with different font size
- Use the same font style across the paper, including Tables, Figures, and captions.
- Proper citation and in text citation and bibliographic listing should follow international standards.

## Specific comments

Topic: The topic should be very specific to Hawassa city administration, as demonstrated by the results and abstract parts. Thus, I suggest using either of the following topics or paraphrased.

- *Determinants of Employee Recruitment in Sidama National Regional State, Ethiopia: The case of Hawassa City administration or*
- *Determinants of Employee Recruitment in Hawassa City administration, Sidama National Regional State, Ethiopia."*
  - Table 1 shows the Sample frame used in the study and you indicated the presence of about 74 public offices. However, you did not show how many of these were considered in your study and how you selected these. Do you think the number of managers contacted, i.e. 2, represents the 74 offices of the 14 sub-cities?
  - The selection of managers should be part of the interview, or the key interview should be separate from the questionnaire survey. The managers can be used to air their views on or validate the results obtained from the questionnaires.
  - Underneath Table 1, you mentioned, "Purposive sampling technique was used to include the HR directorate of the city administration office and managers of the sub-cities." Are the sub-city managers in a good position to provide input on the topic? Or is it sub-city level HR office heads? Needs an explanation, and their respective number should be clearly stated.

## Abstract

The abstract mentioned the undertaking of interviews with the Head of the Human Resources Directorate of the city administration office and the managers of the sub-cities. However, their number should also be indicated, and it should be more than eight. These must constitute the methods and material section (Data collection instrument section). The use of Key informant interviews was mentioned in the methods and materials section but not appearing in the abstract.

This section also stated, "The completed questionnaires were processed and analyzed using tables, graphs, and pie charts" These issues are data presentation tools. The abstract did not mention the data analysis tool/s used to interpret the data collected (the result part suggested the use of SPSS, which helped you to carry out the regression, reliability, etc. analysis).

The findings/results on each objective should be quantitatively (numerically) described, as indicated in the result section, to give your reader a clear perspective and understanding of your paper.

For instance: I quote from the abstract that "the Administration has a clear policy implemented by the Human Resources department, although the staff members are not aware of it" In this context, your reader must know the proportion of staff who are aware of and not aware of the policy environment.

The regression analysis results should also be supported by the numerical values apart from a condensed result of the variance. In this vein, I expect factor-specific results for recruitment and selection, such as vacancy advertisement, selection test, selection interview, pre-employment check-ups, orientation and induction, and selection decisions.

The abstract should also show the possible strategies that can be deployed or developed to improve the recruitment processes, complementing the conclusion section of the paper.

## Introduction

The last paragraph stated that "there has been no study specifically focusing on employee recruitment and selection in Hawassa city," implying the possibility of such study elsewhere. So, what makes your paper unique and significant? What specific knowledge does your paper strive to add to the scientific world?

The redundancy of words and phrases affects the quality of the paper. For instance:

Hawassa city administration is mentioned in each of the specific objectives. Thus, it is recommended to put a single objective (the general objective) at the end of the introduction section. It is suggested to avoid specific objectives and use them as headings and subheadings in the result section.

## Literature

- Definition of Key Terms: Please put the operational definition. The definitions used are neither paraphrased nor proper citation is used after paraphrasing. To give some examples definition of the following terms were extracted from internet sources without paraphrasing (with a potential of plagiarism), which is unacceptable in the scientific world:
- Recruitment  
([https://www.tutorialspoint.com/recruitment\\_and\\_selection/what\\_is\\_recruitment.htm#:~:text=Recruitment%20is%20a%20process%20of.and%20at%20the%20right%20time.](https://www.tutorialspoint.com/recruitment_and_selection/what_is_recruitment.htm#:~:text=Recruitment%20is%20a%20process%20of.and%20at%20the%20right%20time.))
- Selection (<https://www.iedunote.com/selection-process>)
- Concepts of Recruitment
- The source for Figure 1 should be specifically allocated to a source or group of sources (references)

## Materials and methods

- Better to rewrite it as research methods and materials since the materials will be discussed at the end of the section.
- Target Population of the Study: It is better to write the proportion of male and female employees out of the total rather than putting the raw data as it is.
- Sampling Techniques and Sample Size Determination: Rewrite the first word in the first sentence, which missed the letter 'T'.
- Sampling Techniques and Sample Size Determination
- **Data Type and Source:** should be rewritten by incorporating the following essential comments
- Type data are described as primary and secondary.
- The primary data sources: HR offices at the city, sub-city level, and managers/leaders.
- Secondary data sources: should state the hard or soft copy documents utilized to reach your result and conclusion. Thus, HR policy documents, published and unpublished reports, electronic data, etc. can be stated.
- **Tools and Procedures of Data Collection** The paper should clearly and distinctly show the use of questionnaires, interviews, and key-informant interviews.
- The number of key informants should be at least eight (please refer to literature on the possible size of key informants).
- I suggest using a spate heading for each data collection instrument.
- **Method of Data Analysis and Interpretation**
  - The paper indicated the use of quantitative and qualitative analysis. However, the tools used to analyze these needed to be indicated. SPSS, excel, etc. (for quantitative) and thematic content analysis for qualitative analysis?
  - The abstract section indicated tables, graphs, etc, which are not stated in the data analysis and interpretation section. The paper should be consistent.
- Make data validity and reliability test part of the research methods and materials.
- The paper did not indicate the use of any material as indicated in the topic of this specific section.
- Put the reliability and validity test part of this section.

## Result

- **Reliability Assessment** put this part under the research methods and materials section.
- The generated results showed that all the values were above 0.75, indicating acceptable reliability (Table 1). The table is not Table 1; it is Table 2. Please align texts with Tables and Figures appropriately.
- **Correlation of Factors that Influence Recruitment and Selection** The values were not reflected in the abstract.

- The first word in this section must be capitalized (recruitment and selection).
- **Assumptions for Multiple Linear Regression Analysis**
  - **Move this heading, sub-headings, and parts into the research methods part.**
  - **The various assumptions Test** were not indicated as the paper's objectives, while the result is focused entirely on the assumptions. If the paper is to measure the significance of the assumption, then the objectives need to be rewritten in this regard. Otherwise, the result should succinctly use the objectives forming the headings and subheadings.
  - **Linearity Assumption Test** the paragraph needs paraphrasing (Jacoby, William G. "Loess:: a nonparametric, graphical tool for depicting relationships between variables." *Electoral studies* 19, no. 4 (2000): 577-613.): Schmidt, A. F., & Finan, C. (2018). Linear regression and the normality assumption. *Journal of clinical epidemiology*, 98, 146-151.)
  - **Normality Assumption Test** The paragraph needs paraphrasing (Leech, N. L., Barrett, K. C., & Morgan, G. A. (2005). *SPSS for intermediate statistics: Use and interpretation*. Psychology press; Das, K. R., & Imon, A. H. M. R. (2016). A brief review of tests for normality *American Journal of Theoretical and Applied Statistics*, 5(1), 5-12)
  - **Multi-collinearity Assumption Test Only the following result should be presented in the result part and move the others into the methods section.**
- SPSS provides two transformations of the squared correlation coefficients upon request. One is tolerance, which is equal to 1 minus the R2 value. The second is VIF, the variance inflation factor, which is the reciprocal of the tolerance. Tolerance values below 1 indicate a problem. This is commonly assessed using the Variable Inflation Factor (VIF) statistics. VIF values close to 1 indicate small inter-correlations among the independent factors. However, VIF values greater than 10 suggest collinearity as a problem.  $VIF = 1/\text{tolerance}$ , where  $\text{tolerance} = 1 - R^2$ , and  $R^2$  is the coefficient of determination. Additionally, correlation analysis is conducted to examine potential multi-collinearity problems.
- **Table 4.** Results of Multi-collinearity Test should be incorporated.
- **Coefficients of Recruitment and Selection and Other Variables:** Please specify the other variables or use subheading to deal with these variables.
- The result did not present the objectives of the paper as required and I expect each objective to constitute the result part and its extensions.
- **Hypothesis testing using p-values:**
  - **I raise a question that, 'Was this part of your objective?'** As the paper indicated, it is not. Thus, I suggest putting this under the research methods part of the paper.

## Discussion

- The discussion needs to be presented with the convergence and divergence of the paper with other previous studies. The discussion interprets or gives meaning to your paper compared to the literature. The discussion should also indicate the study's implication to HR development and administration at the city, regional, and national levels. Please rewrite the discussion part appropriately.
- Split the paragraph into readable and understandable formats.

## Conclusions

- This section is a recommendation, as the first paragraph stated. However, the conclusion should be drawn from the findings and show its implication and possible limitations that the paper faced in due course of a research approach, data collection, analysis, etc.
- The recommendation should also come with suggestions or indications for future research.

## Reference

- Please make sure that all the reference materials are cited in the text and listed in the reference list.