

# Review of: "Analyzing the Effects of Organic Amendments on Soil Erosion Dynamics: A Comprehensive Study on Application Methods and Timing"

Melissa Simiele<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> University of Molise

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The paper "Analyzing the effects of organic amendments on soil erosion dynamics: a comprehensive study on application methods and timing" involved the study of the effects of four organic soil amendments on soil erosion dynamics. More specifically, the authors analyzed the effects of the different soil amendments by employing two different application methods (on the surface and mixing) and evaluated the different effects over the course of 6 months.

The paper is well-written, and below, I make some suggestions for improving small things:

- In section 2.3, the authors can add the article "the" to the ASTM D-285 method, writing "using **the** ASTM D-285 method";
- In Figure 4, I recommend removing the red underlines under the words "biochar" and "vermicompost". These underlines are due to the autocorrect not recognizing the words.

Also, again in Fig. 4, at "step one," the error s amendments in "amendment preparation" should be corrected;

- In Figs. 5, 6, and 7, in the legend, correct "after rainfal" to "after rainfall";
- In section 3.2.3 "Clay percentage," in the fourth line, correct the sentence "Figure 5 visually depicts the trends in sand percentage across different..." by writing "Figure 5 visually depicts the trends in **sand, silt, and clay** percentage across different...";
- In Tables 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10, write the initials of "cm<sup>3</sup>" and "sec" in lowercase, and correct "gr" to "g" and "gr/lit" to "g/L";
- In the "References," I recommend using the same formatting for all cited articles. Specifically, I recommend defining how to report the journal of publication because, for example, the same journal, "Science of Total Environment," was reported differently within the "References." For example, the journal was written in full ("Science of Total Environment") for the paper by Sadeghi et al. (2016 b), while it was reported as "Sci Total Environ" for the paper by Siedt et al. (2021).