Review of: "From Silicon to Services: How Intellectual Capital Shapes Taiwan's Economic Transformation"

Mohammad Reza Fathi[1]

1 University of Tehran, Iran, Islamic Republic of

Specific Critiques

1. Methodological Clarity and Rigor

Sample Size and Selection: The article does not specify the sample size or the criteria for selecting firms within the manufacturing, technology, and service sectors. A clear description of the sampling method (e.g., random sampling, stratified sampling) and the rationale for the chosen sample size is crucial for the validity of the findings. Without this information, the generalizability of the results remains questionable.

Data Collection Methods: While the article mentions empirical analysis, it lacks detail regarding the data collection methods used. For example, were surveys distributed, and if so, what type of survey was used? Additionally, how was the reliability and validity of the survey instrument assessed? These details are essential to establish the credibility of the findings.

2. Quantitative Analysis

Statistical Techniques: The article mentions the use of various statistical analyses but fails to specify which statistical tests were employed to analyze the data. For instance, if Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) is used, the article should provide details on model fit indices (e.g., CFI, TLI, RMSEA) to demonstrate the adequacy of the model. Furthermore, the article should clarify how the relationships between IC components and firm performance metrics were statistically tested.

Lack of Control Variables: The analysis does not appear to account for potential confounding variables that could influence the relationship between IC and firm performance. Factors such as firm size, industry type, and economic conditions should be controlled for to enhance the robustness of the findings.

Presentation of Results: The results section lacks clarity in presenting the findings. For instance, it would be beneficial to include tables or figures summarizing key statistical findings, such as correlation coefficients, regression coefficients, and significance levels. This would enhance the reader's understanding of the data.

3. Theoretical Framework and Literature Review

Integration of Theories: While the article references several theoretical frameworks, it does not adequately integrate them to support the study's hypotheses. A more cohesive presentation of how these theories interact and contribute to the study's objectives would strengthen the theoretical foundation.

Literature Gaps: The literature review identifies gaps but does not sufficiently justify how the current study addresses these gaps. A clearer articulation of how the findings contribute to existing literature on IC and firm performance would enhance the article's significance.

4. **Discussion and Implications**

Interpretation of Findings: The discussion section should provide a more in-depth interpretation of the findings. For instance, how do the results align or contrast with previous studies? Discussing the implications of the findings in the context of Taiwan's economic environment would provide valuable insights.

Practical Implications: The article mentions that the findings offer strategic insights for policymakers and business leaders, but it lacks specific recommendations. Providing actionable recommendations based on the findings would enhance the article's practical relevance.

5. **Conclusion and Future Research Directions**

- **Future Research Suggestions**: While the conclusion emphasizes the importance of IC, it does not adequately suggest avenues for future research. Identifying specific areas for further investigation would help guide subsequent studies in this field.

Consider these papers in your manuscript:

A Combined Fuzzy Multi-Criteria Decision Making Framework for Evaluation of Islamic Banks: A Case of MENA Region

Using fuzzy DEMATEL and fuzzy Similarity to develop a human capital evaluation model

Analysis of factors affecting the implementation of green human resource management using a hybrid fuzzy AHP and type-2 fuzzy DEMATEL approach