

Review of: "Picture collage: A pedagogical reflective practice tool for nursing students in mental health practice"

Becky Ingham-Broomfield

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Thank you for asking me to review this very exciting concept and paper. It engaged me from the beginning and the artwork also clearly identified what was meant by Picture Collage. It is easy for me as an academic and artist to understand what was meant by the title but not all would understand. The overall content is really valuable, and the reflections and collages are very heart warming. The process had a very valuable impact on the students with the knock-on effect to their future care both in MH and any other nursing sphere.

Feedback:

The World Health Organization uses a z. I note the first use is an s, the second a z, then back to s at the end of the Introduction. It remains an s in the next paragraph. You need consistency and it should be a z on all occasions of using WHO as a reference. <https://www.who.int/>

"One" is an older expression, with tones of superiority, and I would suggest the use of "a person thinks..." throughout that paragraph. Some can be removed, for example, just say daily functioning rather than one's daily functioning. I believe your paper is trying to reach a more recent teacher and student audience. The nurses are more likely to be a younger generation, so your language needs to reflect that.

I would argue that such an important point as stigma should provide more than one reference using more recent resources, especially as your only resource is now 7 years old. **"Consequently, like in some other parts of the world, there is a reluctance to seek help due to common factors like shame and the fear of being stigmatised and socially sanctioned for their mental health issues (Salahedin and Mason 2016)."** The point also applies to your discussion on stigma as this concept is gradually being broken down. I believe you really need to provide more evidence that stigma is still a problem/major problem in 2023. The 2013 and 2017 references, on their own, are not strong enough. MH issues are far more recognised and accepted in 2023. MH has come a long way over the past 5 years.

I also noted you brought in religious values so perhaps explore this much more in relation to the UAE. Address the more specific problems. I think this would be more valuable than your discussion of world-wide values (especially with your use of the WHO references). Overall, I believe your references are too old and this paper would be much stronger and viable, is your evidence base was deeper and current.

"The vulnerability of university students' mental health has been documented by several researchers during their transition to adulthood (Conley et al 2014)". This is too old on its own and you stated several researchers. Can you

provide a stronger argument using more evidence?

“This consisted of 3 hours of weekly tutorial seminars on theoretical knowledge in mental health and mental disorders including 12 days of mental health clinical practice over a six-week mental health nursing placement”. This once again needs consistency. You need to use numbers or words, not both.

Regarding reflective practice you are very welcome to read and use my paper as this is a subject I find is not taught well, particularly the use of models to support a logical and systematic process of reflection.

A nurses' guide to using models of reflection

<https://www.ajan.com.au/index.php/AJAN/article/view/395>

I hope this feedback has been helpful and I wish you all the very best with this excellent concept.