Review of: "American Robin (Turdus Migratorius) Blood Lead Levels May Reflect Elevated Soil Lead Levels: Further Consequences of the Flint Water Crisis"

Joseph Di Liberto[1]

1 College of William and Mary

Potential competing interests: The author(s) declared that no potential competing interests exist.

Louise-Zahor *et al.* is a phenomenally-written paper on a crucially-important and (Unfortunately) topical subject. The studies uses a common and widespread migratory thrush to assess for relationships between Pb contaminated sites (Through irrigation) and morphometrically-assessed body condition. There were a some minor places that the authors could improve the clarity of their work but overall, this is a great paper and a fascinating read!

Specific Comments:

Introduction:

-Paragraph 1: Diving into how birds specifically are affected by urbanization is a little specific when the main idea of the paragraph is on urbanization in wildlife as a whole. While the information on songbirds' body condition being affected by BLL is fine (Moreso as an example), it might be better to change your final sentence into being more overall urban-wildlife centric rather than just birds.

-Paragraph 4: How does lawn watering affect AMRO's BLL? Maybe clarify the link in elevated lead levels in irrigated areas with AMRO's feeding habits (Soil invertebrates) more directly.

-Paragraph 4: You mention your study species twice…we already know the species so it's a bit redundant. Could you build up the Flint crisis first before you introduce your method of studying it through AMROs?

Methods:

Study Sites:

-While each college campus does have lawns, AMRO's ranges aren't limited to just these specific sampling areas. How do we know rural areas aren't full of farms that irrigate land more than college lawns? Do the housing/businesses around the college campuses and parks irrigate their lawns? More information on how these lawns could be distinguishable from each other would help in piecing this apart.

-How consistently-affected are AMROs as a migratory species-ones that are only in the affected area for ~1/2 the year? How would this compare to species that are accustomed to humans/ live around them exclusively like HOSPs and ROPIs? While I don't see a problem with using a migratory species outright-others have done it I'm sure-some further context would be a welcome addition. There may be even more of a need for studying Pb exposure in migratory species so it might help the paper too!

Hematological Procedures:

-Why did you mention how you defined hemocrit if it's not used in any of your analysis? Was that just used for the separate study, as mentioned already?

Statistical Analyses:

-I know it's likely implied, but I there is a lack of clarity on your treatments. Outlining them more concretely here would help prepare readers for the results since you're making multiple comparisons between different treatments. Maybe not including "Ypsilanti" and explaining that it's an unexposed irrigated (Or coming up with another, more consistently-descriptive term) could help.

Discussion:

-Reads very well and really elevates the importance of this kind of ecotoxicological work! Well done!