

Review of: "Ecosystem Services Inequality Driven by Agroextractivism in Salamina, Colombia: A Critical Institutional Analysis"

Claudia Múnera¹

¹ Australian National University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Interesting article summarising aspects of inequality around agroextractivism and its impacts on ecosystem services. It contributes to academic discussions on power, ecosystem services and environmental governance.

I invite the author to revise a few points that might help clarifying and strengthening article.

First, the section on ecosystem services and governance needs more clarity and a 'storyline' informing the logic of the article. In particular, the Primmer et al. framework should be expanded to explain its use in the case study. The cascade approach is interesting but is not clear how it connects in the overall logic of that section.

In that sense, I invite the author to consider revisiting the governance of ecosystem services in Colombia with a few tweaks. My understanding of the PNGIBSE in Colombia, is that it is an instrument that guides action. I see the SINA as the hierarchical governance (framed by the constitution and the environmental legislation) and the set of institutions that frame and inform the PNGIBSE. The SINA also provides the guidelines for adaptive collaborative governance. At the local level, the governing strategic behaviours is usually done by regional environmental authorities and many other actors. Then the PNGIBSE is the boundary object that enable communication across governance actors. This is my interpretation of how the SINA works and regulate environmental action in Colombia. I feel that discussing more on the role of those local agencies, can provide a good contribution and potentially serve as the basis for practical recommendations.

Local environmental authorities (like Corpocaldas) have a big role in managing natural resources, and if their role is being obscured by vested interests from corporations, it should be better explained.

I was also wondering if you might explain why the change from coffee to avocado has implications for water resources (in the social attributes section) for example, adding a short phrase explaining if avocado needs more irrigation of something like that, to contextualise the reader with the problem.

Regarding the above, I wonder if the problem lays in shifting from one crop (coffee) to another (avocado, plantain). As coffee has been a traditional crop in the area, it seems to me that the main problem is land concentration, rather than a shift in crops. You are implicitly explaining it, but is not totally clear to a reader.

The Discourses section 3.1.4 needs to be grounded in literature, at the moment it reads as your interpretation, but this section is more conceptual than discussion, isn't it? for example, you can present critiques and counterarguments to make

this section stronger.

In the Rules and norms section might be also relevant to consider existing regulations and CONPES to regulate payment for ecosystem services, and discuss the role of the local environmental authority in regulating water and provision/payment of ES.

Even if this is a meta-reflection, as you explain in the introduction, it might be useful if you can provide some details about the methods used for data collection (interviews, workshops) and disclose any Human Ethics protocols used to collect data (if applicable).

Finally, I think the paper still needs to better explain how and which ecosystem services are being unequally distributed, starting with outlining social and environmental impacts of this new crop (and how different from previous crops, i.e. coffee), and expanding more on how local people connect with nature and ES (section 3.3.2).

Table 3 is very interesting. Would it be possible to explain the mechanisms to activate in the context of your case study? maybe adding a column to provide examples of existing institutional mechanisms that can enable such changes?

Well done, and looking forward to learning more about this interesting case study.