

Peer Review

Review of: "Black Female Counseling Students' Experiences of Racial Microaggressions at a Southern University"

Ana M. Martínez Alemán¹

1. Educational Leadership & Higher Education, Boston College, United States

"Black Female Counseling Students' Experiences of Racial Microaggressions at a Southern University"

Overall Assessment:

This qualitative phenomenological study makes a contribution to understanding the experiences of Black female counseling students in predominantly White institutions, particularly in the Southern United States. The research is timely and addresses an important gap in the literature.

Strengths:

1. Methodological Rigor:

- The study employs appropriate phenomenological methodology for exploring lived experiences
- Strong attention to trustworthiness through triangulation, member checks, and thick description
- Clear documentation of data collection and analysis procedures

2. Theoretical Framework:

- Well-grounded in existing literature on racial microaggressions
- Thorough review of relevant concepts and previous research
- Clear connection to current issues in higher education

3. Results:

- Rich, detailed presentation of themes with supporting quotes
- Clear organization of findings

- Good integration of individual interviews, focus groups, and journal entries

4. Implications:

- Practical recommendations for counselor educators and institutions
- Clear connection between findings and suggested interventions
- Thoughtful discussion of broader implications for campus climate

Summary of suggested revisions:

- Address methodological clarity
- Expand the discussion section
- Provide more specific implementation guidance for recommendations

Detailed revisions to improve the manuscript:

Methodology:

- The sample size (n=5) is relatively small, though appropriate for phenomenological research
- Could benefit from more detail about the data analysis process
- More information about researcher positionality (which is required in a phenomenological study) would strengthen trustworthiness

Discussion:

- Thicken/add more description of the specific institutional context
- Address regional factors that might influence findings more thoroughly
- Including richer historical context about the institution would be valuable
- Expand on how findings compare to existing literature
- Expand the discussion of alternative interpretations of the data
- Strengthen the discussion of limitations
- Provide more specific actionable steps for institutions
- Add more detail about the implementation of suggested interventions

Despite some limitations, this is a well-executed qualitative study that makes a contribution to the literature on racial microaggressions in higher education. The findings have important implications for counselor education programs and higher education institutions more broadly.

This study fills a gap in the literature and provides valuable insights for improving the experiences of Black female counseling students in predominantly White institutions.

Declarations

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.