

Review of: "[Review Article] Excessive Aluminum in Soil"

Guoyou Zhang¹

¹ Nanjing University of Information Science and Technology

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

This manuscript provides an overview of aluminum contamination in soil, including sources, hazards, and treatment options. This topic should receive more attention so that we can all work together to solve this problem.

As a review manuscript, it is important to be aware of all the research related to the topic, especially the published scientific literature. Unfortunately, the current version of the manuscript fails to do this and is even a bit too simplistic. Some important sections are only mentioned in a cursory manner and not fully and thoroughly analyzed. There are also important contents for which no specific information and citations are provided.

The structure of the manuscript is also different from that of a traditional natural science paper, but given that this is an interdisciplinary issue, it is barely acceptable as long as the topic is clearly articulated.

In my opinion, this manuscript is far from the level of a scientific review paper that can be formally published, and I suggest the authors carefully revise and enhance it, or try to change it to be a letter or other form of article.

Some detailed comments:

1. Title, not precise
2. Abstract, background of aluminum pollution in soil and detailed strategies for field management should be clarified
3. First section, this part is mainly in describing the effects of aluminum in soil on plants, which is too simple, I would suggest adding the results of aluminum treatment experiments and literature on the reactions of different plant types such as trees, crops, grasses, etc., in addition to analyzing and summarizing the specific aluminum concentrations and treatment times in the different literature.
4. Second section, this part is too simple too, more information could be added including results from recently published articles.
5. Figures, neither figure is mentioned or explained in the main text.