

# Review of: "Stock Estimation Trial From Spatio-temporal Limited Data of Six Commercial Species in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon"

Thanh Luu Pham

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

I believe the manuscript has potential for publication following some revisions.

## Introduction

In this study, the existing knowledge and gaps regarding Fish Stocks in the Middle Madeira River, Southwest Amazon, were not sufficiently addressed. The author should elucidate the gaps in knowledge identified in previous studies, demonstrate how their work builds upon existing understanding, and clarify the novel contributions of their research.

## 2.1. Study area and data collection

It is better to provide a map of the study area with the monitoring stations to aid international readers.

Authors said that the methods used for data collection followed Lourenço et al. (2020). I think a concise summary of these methods should be provided.

## Results

The authors have presented figures and tables without accompanying descriptive text. It is essential that they provide textual descriptions for the data presented in Figure 1, Table 1, as well as the concept of Rendimento Sustentável (MSY).

## Discussion

In my opinion, in the Discussion section, authors should compare their results with any available data on fish stocks from previous studies conducted in the same area, or alternatively, compare their findings with studies on similar fish populations in other Amazon rivers.