

Review of: "A Research Note on Natural Reclamation Processes that Support Mangrove Biodiversity Spheres: Sedimentation in Three Major River Deltas in Northwestern Luzon Using Aerial Imagery"

Christina Anna Orieschnig¹

¹ Institute of Research for Development

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

While the overall topic is interesting and the results deserving of publication, there are several issues that need to be addressed.

To begin with, the form of the research is too casual, both in the language used and the formatting. In terms of language, punctuation is sometimes missing, tenses shift inconsistently throughout the text, and there are several awkward ("the lower limb") and informal ("will indeed come in quite handy") formulations. Additionally, the text switches between referring to the author in the first and third person. The figures seem more appropriate to a blog post rather than a scientific publication. Legends, for instance, are missing in several figures.

Another issue is how the paper is structured. The study goals and research questions need to be outlined in more depth in the introduction. More information needs to be given on the methods. How exactly were the study areas delineated? How was the change detection carried out? How was the validation carried out using the drone imagery? It would also be useful to have a separate section introducing the data used in more detail. Several pieces of information - such as the different bands of WorldView 2 imagery - are only introduced haphazardly in the results. In the results, a clearer explanation of the validation needs to be given - what metrics were calculated and what they show. It would also be helpful to see a comparison of the delta growth and the current size of each delta, perhaps in graph-form, to highlight the differences between them. (An interpretation is only provided in the very last paragraph of the conclusion, which could be expanded on in a discussion section.) The note also needs to discuss the limitations of the approach.

Finally, one aspect that struck me was that in the current presentation of the research note it is not at all clear what the role of aerial imagery and the meaning of "macro-, meso-, and micro-scale" is. The author does not go into a detailed explanation of this terminology, although it is repeated several times. While it's clear that the 2013 WorldView imagery is compared to a 1979 map for change detection, the role of aerial imagery is unclear, except to illustrate the deltas in visually appealing ways.