

# Review of: "Analyzing the Effects of Organic Amendments on Soil Erosion Dynamics: A Comprehensive Study on Application Methods and Timing"

Arianna Latini<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> ENEA

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

The current manuscript entitled "Analyzing the Effects of Organic Amendments on Soil Erosion Dynamics: A Comprehensive Study on Application Methods and Timing" compares the effects of different organic amendments on soil properties, such as texture, runoff volume, and rate of sedimentation. The amendments evaluated were barberry biochar, vermicompost, poultry manure, and wheat straw. The topic and the analyses performed are very interesting. The manuscript is original because of the geographical region and the particular amendments investigated. Anyway, in my opinion, the manuscript needs to be improved in all sections. English should be corrected mainly for grammar errors.

Section 2.3 should be written in a better way...

You should explain what you mean by Biochar Efficiency (BE)...

Could you give more information, in Section 2.6, on the 4 replicates?

Please give more information on the methods used. The only mentioning of the utilized devices limits the clarity and then the understanding of the results.

Results should be written following journal standards.

Error bars in Figures 5, 6, and 7 are missing.

I personally would avoid too many subsections in the Discussion.

Definitively, the manuscript deserves to be published because it's interesting and helps fill the gaps in the knowledge on the short-term impacts of biological soil amendments, but it needs major revisions.