

## Peer Review

# Review of: "Kampung Pelangi Semarang: Its Success, Decline, and the Current Status of the Rainbow Village"

Rafael Martinez<sup>1</sup>

1. Singapore University of Technology and Design, Singapore, Singapore

The manuscript presents a thorough and insightful analysis of the internal conflicts that contributed to the decline of Kampung Pelangi Semarang's urban revitalisation project. Its emphasis on governance and stakeholder engagement is commendable, and the detailed examination of the shift from a top-down to a bottom-up approach—alongside the identification of key factors such as intra-organizational tensions within Pokdarwis and the impact of COVID-19—adds significant value to the discussion.

That said, the analysis would benefit from a more nuanced engagement with the project's broader complexities. I encourage the authors to incorporate a wider range of stakeholder perspectives, particularly those of community leaders and residents, to enrich the discussion of internal conflicts and deepen the understanding of the project's stagnation, decline in tourism, and waning community engagement.

One particularly promising avenue for further development is the exploration of competing narratives within the visual and symbolic design of Kampung Pelangi. The use of vibrant colours as a strategy for aesthetic revitalization contrasts with the deployment of murals and iconography that convey moral and ideological messages rooted in national ideals such as Pancasila. These dual narratives—tourism-driven visual appeal versus ideological expression—may constitute a latent source of tension, potentially shaping residents' acceptance or resistance to the project. Examining how these narratives intersect, conflict, or reinforce one another could provide critical insights into the socio-political dynamics at play.

Additionally, I recommend that the authors problematize the concept of "slum" in urban Indonesia and in relation to these competing narratives. Engaging critically with the discourse of slum revitalization would allow for a more comprehensive framing of the project's challenges, extending the analysis beyond internal organizational conflict.

Incorporating these suggestions could strengthen the manuscript's contribution by offering a more multifaceted account of Kampung Pelangi's trajectory. It would also enhance its relevance to broader debates on urban revitalisation, highlighting the importance of cultural narratives, spatial politics, and power relations in shaping community-based development initiatives in urban and semi-urban environments in Indonesia.

## **Declarations**

**Potential competing interests:** No potential competing interests to declare.