

Review of: "Understanding on Social Utopia: West to East"

Joyjit Ghosh¹

¹ Vidyasagar University

Potential competing interests: No potential competing interests to declare.

Review Report for Qeios

Sadiat Mannan's "Understanding on Social Utopia: West to East" is an interesting article that attempts to discuss Tagore, Rousseau, and Marx from the philosophical perspectives of 'social utopia'. The idea of social utopia, however, must be made clear at the beginning of the essay. Moreover, the central argument of the essay should be clearly reflected through the title.

While discussing Tagore's philosophy of creation in the abstract, the author states, 'Constructive behaviour takes man further and further away from the very essence of life'. I would request him/her to give the source (I mean, wherefrom he/she has got the idea). 'This essay', the author writes, 'discusses and compares Tagore's evolution' etc. The phrase 'Tagore's evolution' is inexact and needs clarification.

The author is advised to avoid vague statements: 1. '*The Origin of Species* is a piece of work that is written in a Victorian style'. 2. 'As we are freed of our objective self, man develops this love for the self-depicting admiration to perfection.' 3. 'He claims that it is in that stage that a person is defined as the man she is going to become.' 4. 'If the Western political thought is put under scrutiny, the society and man become a product of their own higher power; portrayed by their inherent nobility.'

'Rousseau states that self-preservation, after being achieved, develops to *amore propre*, which is the love of oneself, and eventually leads to vanity'. One may be reminded of Tagore's statement: "Love of self, whether national or individual, can have no other destination except suicide". (*Letters to a friend: Rabindranath Tagore's Letters to C.F. Andrews*, New Delhi: Rupa, 2009, p. 143).

'The man who occupied the walls of innumerable Bengalis during the first half of the twentieth century did not regard himself to be anything but a poet.' One may remember Tagore's statement, "I have come to the conclusion that a poet ought to be a poet and nothing else." (*Selected Letters of Rabindranath Tagore*, ed. Krishna Dutta and Andrew Robinson, Cambridge University Press, First South Asian Edition, 2005, p. 186.)

'Tagore is a man that is portrayed to be a romantic, and his immense popularity in the West started to decline when he was started to be labeled as a mystic.' What does it mean: 'Tagore is a man that is portrayed to be a romantic'? Give the source with proper citation: 'his immense popularity in the West started to decline when he was started to be labeled as a mystic'.

The idea of 'Mukti' can be elaborated with reference to Tagore's statement, "The barrier of Self *ismaya* (*Letters to a Friend: Rabindranath Tagore's Letters to C.F. Andrews*, New Delhi: Rupa, 2009, p. 58). Again, Tagore wrote to C.F. Andrews, "It is our pride which seeks difference, and gloats upon it. But sympathy is a higher faculty, being our spiritual organ of sight; it has the natural vision of the *advaitam*." (p. 251)

Typos and grammatical errors should be avoided: 1. 'and even though one may not consider one of the most renowned poets, Rabindranath Tagore'

2. 'Tagore's take a longer period of time through evolution, albeit mostly social.'

In brief, the essay should be thoroughly revised before it is considered for publication.

The author is advised to read Tagore's *Nationalism* ("Nationalism in India" in particular) for the understanding of Tagore's idea of 'samaj' (society).

The essay titled "The Interface between Education and the 'Rural Uplift Work': Re-reading Tagore's Letters, Lectures and Addresses" by Joyjit Ghosh, Vidyasagar University, in *GITANJALI AND BEYOND*, Issue No. 2 may be consulted for the understanding of Tagore's idea of education.